EXPLICATION OF THE POTTER AND THE POTTER’S CLAY

Avtar Singh Dhaliwal, MD
3606, Honeywood drive
Johnson City, TN 37604
e-mail: guravtar@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
The Sabd, “mittee Musulman ki” (AGGS, M 1, p 466.) became contentious in the court of Aurangzeb (1661 CE), when his Islamic clerks applied sophistic interpretation to embarrass Baba Ram Rai, son of the 7th Sikh Guru, Guru Har Rai. Their misinterpretation of the Sabd implying disposition (burial) of human remains according to Islamic law and then the potter digging clay from the grave of a Muslim to make pots, pans and bricks; has never been challenged by any Sikh or Non-Sikh scholar. The critical and discrete analysis of the Sabd provided logical certitude completely opposing premise that the Sabd is about the creation of a human from clay and suffering through the worldly entanglements. To elaborate on the notion that human sufferings brought on by the individuals themselves regardless of their faiths; Guru Nanak expounded a unique way of substantiating emancipation of human in the Sabd “mittee Musulman ki”, known only to the Creator of it ALL. This paper will discuss the potter, potter’s clay, and reasonable explication of the Sabd to emphasize UNIQUE Philosophy of Guru Nanak in its true interpretation.

INTRODUCTION
The year 1661CE marks a significant point in the history of Sikhs, when Islamic clerks in the court of ruling king Aurangzeb applied sophistic approach in the quest of suppressing Sikh, questioned Baba Ram Rai, a 15 year old son of 7th Sikh Guru, Guru Har Rai. In their limited understanding of the Sabd, “mittee Musulmân ki paiddae paeyee kumhiaar--the lump of clay for creating a Musulmân (human) falls into the hands of the Potter-the Creator “(AGGS, M 1, p. 466)[1], uttered and written by Guru Nanak, interpretation got misconstrued as referring to the burial of Human (Muslim) remains according to the Islamic ethics. The next sentence related to the potter digging clay from the grave of the Musulman for creating pots, pans and then firing it, was misinterpreted also in literal translation. Baba Ram Rai, supposedly an intelligent young man and very savvy in history of Sikh and Gurbani was quarried for use of the word ‘Musulman’ in the Sabd. Baba Ram Rai, being deluded by the lure of royalty, and possible personal glory, altered the word ‘Musulman’ to ‘bayimaan’ (faithless person), claiming error in inscribing. For the last 350 years, the sophistic misinterpretation of the Sabd by the Islamic clerks, however, had been carried ever since by the clergy, Sikh and the non-Sikh scholars. There is not a single document available that challenges the interpretation “the potter digs clay from the Musulmân’s grave to make pots, pans and bricks.”

With current information available in scriptures of Semitic and Asian religions, it is fare to say that the translations and interpretations of ‘the Sabd’ have been grossly incorrect and not even close to the intended text in the Sabd. This paper is an attempt to discuss the clay, the potter, and their relation to the creation along with the reasons why Guru Nanak chose the specific word ‘Musulman’ in the Sabd, and provide comprehensive and correct explication of the Sabd.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND
The Sabd organized in ‘Asa Di Vaar’ in a genre reflects Guru Nanak’s intense feelings and concerns for social, political and religious subjugations of the common person by the domineering Brahmanism superimposed by Islamic
supremacy. To expose the hypocrisy of religious struggle for dominance, Guru Nanak was elaborating practicing methods of Brahmanism both in Islam and Hinduism, with conclusion that it is the Creator that knows the best. The Sabd he wrote follows:

Translation: The Moslems believe that the cremated dead bodies go to hell. That is why the Moslems prefer to bury their dead. Occasionally, the potter digs the clay from the grave of the Mussalmaan. Because, the burial grounds dirt gradually turns into clay, is preferred by the potter to fashion pots, pans and bricks etc. The potter, when fires the fashioned pots, pans and bricks the burning clay produces crackling sounds. The clay weeps and the sparks burst out of it. (But, Liberation or emancipation of the soul has nothing to do with cremation or burial of the dead). O’ Nanak, the Creator who fashioned all this creation only knows the truth.

Puran Singh [16] had translated the Sabd in the English language, as:
“In vain do the Moslems think of burial to save their soul? The Clay of Musulmán’s body falls into the potter’s lump like other earth, and is fashioned into pots; and the Musulmán’s clay is in the fire: the pots baked, and while burning, bemoans its fate. It burns and weeps; its tears are the sparks that fly about. Vain and foolish are these discussions of burial and cremation. Who knows the secret of such things? The Creator who made all this knows about it.”

There is hardly any variation in the translation of the Sabd referred above by Sant Singh Khalsa [6] and others relating to the disposition of dead person’s remains in different religions and specifying especially to the clay from the grave of the Mussalmaan. The highly notable Sikh scholars and non-Sikh scholars have written interpretations of the Sabd exactly the same whether it is in the Punjabi or the English language. (Faridkot wala Teeka [3] Mahan Kosh—Bhai Kahn Singh Nabha[10], Sri Guru Granth Sahib Darpan—Dr Sahib Singh [17], Sri Guru Granth Sahib (Eng.) Dr Gopal Singh [14], The Sikh Religion—Max Arthur McAuliffe [7] Asa di Vaar—G.S. Randhawa [12]).

The Slokas (Sabds) in Asa Di Vaar with accompanying stanzas 2-6 (paurree 2-6) are related to traditional practices for worship and reflection upon the gods and goddesses by the Brahmanic scholars among the Hindu clergy and common people. Guru Nanak is also similarly elaborating the preaching and practice of Islam among Moslems. In spite of the best efforts in research, it was hard to capture anywhere in the Sabds/paurree 2
through 6, that Guru Nanak was even indicating the disposition of human remains according to ethics in either religion. There is neither a single word that reflects Islamic traditional emancipation of soul in burial nor burning in hell of soul during cremation. Prof Sahib Singh [17] in his Punjabi translation of the Sabd, has also noted that the Sabd has nothing to do with liberation of the Soul in burial or in cremation.

The Clay, its composition and relation to Humans

The clay covers almost two third surface of the Earth [13] and is responsible in holding it together. The fine particulate of earthly dust having undergone some degree of consolidation turns into clay. The clay particles expand when contacted with water and shrink to harden when exposed to heat. During the exchange process when water is evaporating from the clay particulate, it produces crackling sounds varying in frequency depending upon its chemical composition. In a moistened phase clay acts like plastic and thus can be molded into any shape. It does not take much water to expand the clay particles and then it becomes an impermeable rock and water flows on the surface without getting soaked into the clay particles. That explains the water holding ability in various water reservoirs or its application as a core in water dams. The plastic properties of clay are secondary to the crystals of minerals like hydrous silicates of Aluminum and Magnesium along with iron, potassium, sodium, phosphorus, Sulphur and organic substances. In mechanical analysis of soil carried out by Shaw and Weaver [13] and according to the international classification, the clay particle has a grain size of 0.002 mm/0.00008in. According to the report published in, “Engineering Geology Special Publications; 2006 CE”, Shaw and Weaver [13] in 1965CE conducted a bulk mineral analysis of over 400 samples, and reported the modal mineralogical composition of siliciclastic mudrocks to be:

- 60% clay minerals
- 30% quartz and chert
- 5% feldspar
- 4% carbonates
- 1% organic matter
- 1% iron oxides

Harper et al [5] outlined percentages of various components found essential in human body, as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oxygen</td>
<td>65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carbon</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hydrogen</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nitrogen</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calcium</td>
<td>1.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phosphorus</td>
<td>1.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potassium</td>
<td>0.35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sulfur</td>
<td>0.25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sodium</td>
<td>0.15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magnesium</td>
<td>0.05%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Copper, Zinc, Selenium, Molybdenum, Fluorine, Chlorine, Iodine, Manganese, Cobalt, Iron (0.70%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lithium, Strontium, Aluminum, Silicon, Lead, Vanadium and arsenic, Bromine (trace amounts)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the analysis cited above, it is obvious that the basic natural components of clay and human body are essentially similar in nature; since, human body gets most of its nutrients from the earth (plants, vegetables, meats etc. etc.) The evolutionary development of human beings, though originated from amphibian sources, is dependent upon the earthly products for survival and sustenance. The ancient believers in Asian mythology and Semitic religions have been confiding in the creationism, but, subsequent Vedic/Vedantic beliefs staying coherent with timely changes have aligned with the evolutionary development of human beings. Guru Nanak believed and promulgated philosophy of evolution.

The Potter

The Gurmukhi word commonly used for ‘potter’ is ‘kumhar’ (कुम्हर), ‘Ghumhar’ (घुम्हर) or ‘kumbhaar’ (कुम्हार). All these words according to Bhai Kahn Singh Nabha are from the root word of ‘Kumbhkaar’ (कुम्हार) that is conjoined word as Kumbh+kaar (कुम्ह+कार), meaning kumbh, ‘a pot’ andkaar, the artist that creates it.

The characteristic of the potter’s ability to create has been applied as a metaphor by the religious minds conceiving God as the Creator either to fashion human beings and other forms of creation from the potter’s clay or creating environments for evolutionary development and progress.

Bhagat Kabir[1] in the following Sabd addresses the Creator as a potter-kumhar, when he wrote:

**The Creator using the same resources of clay has designed varied forms,
Neither the created receptacles have any defects nor the Creator-kumhar.**

AGGS, Bhagat Kabir, p. 1350.

Dr Sahib Singh, in translating these sentences has also called the Creator in Punjabi language a potter—kumhar. [17]
One very significant aspect forgotten by the translators of Guru Nanak’s Sabd in discussion (AGGS, M 1, p 466) is that the kumhars are not expected to dig into the graves of anybody to get clay for their trade. The kumhars existed in India way before the invasion of the Muslims and their graves. They had been using clay to fashion all kinds of pots and pans, bricks etc. ever since the man became domesticated and learnt agriculture. The origin of pottery in India described by John Marshall [8] in an official account of Archaeological Excavations at Mohenjo-Daro Carried out by the Government of India between the Years 1922CE and 1927CE, being “multiplicity and variety of its shapes-most of them peculiar to the Indus valley and quite distinct from those of Persia and Mesopotamia”, is evidence enough that the craft of the potter had been practiced there from time immemorial. These cultures at the time even had wheel-made pottery as done by the potter of today.

The Potter’s Clay
Since the concept of Creation has been accepted by the Semitic religions, origin of human beings most commonly is believed to be from the potter’s clay [11]. All Semitic Scriptures in one form or another are promulgating that God created everything in six days. The Creator (as a potter) fashioned the figurine from clay first, then breathed life into its nostrils and formed the human being. (Genesis 2:6)

ISLAM
The followers of Islam believe in every word written in the Holy Scripture called Quran. In Surah 15, verse 26, the Holy Mohammed stated the following:

‘Walaqad khalaqna al-insana minsalsalin min hama-in masnoon’15:26 [12]

(Translation) “Verily We created man of potter’s clay of dark mud altered.”

Islam claiming the same fundamental belief as Christianity and Judaism relies upon the creationist which essentially entails that God created the cosmos in six days; hence human being created from a figurine made from potter’s clay and God breathing life into the nostrils. Scientifically, it may be difficult to explain that a figurine of clay can be made alive by breathing into its nostrils. However, spirituality/religiosity based upon metaphoric

language explains the same evolutionary process of human being from a single cell first appearing in the gaseous altered materials. This also explains the difference in basic mythology of man in creationism and evolution.

The Muslim invaders, in addition to robbing India of her riches, came with an agenda to enslave Indians and establish another Islamic state in the Southeast Asia. They started promulgating Islamic philosophy according to the supremacist views of the Islamic hierarchy. It’s no wonder that, they stretched the metaphor of the potter and the potter’s clay associated with the Musulman as their reason to question relevance of the Sabd. By associating clay of the grave with the Musulman, Islamic clerks developed sophistic explanation to discredit cremation in the Hindu and Sikh traditions. Somehow, they had forgotten the verses Al Hijr 15:26-29 mentioned in the Holy Quran for the clay as the altered mud in creation of human being.

Sikhism
Guru Nanak recognized the perpetual struggle of Islamic leaders strengthening to dominate India with promulgation of creationism as recorded in the Holy Quran. This stated that “human beings came to be when God breathed into the nostrils of the figurine made from potter’s clay.” But, Guru Nanak had already credited evolution by stating:

Gaseous material originated from the Primal creation, and produced water from it.

from water life evolved in three places (air, earth and water), and depicts life in each and every form.

AGGS, M 1, p 19.

Guru Angad further augmented the human relation to earth, water and wind in his Sloka that is part of the Japji, opening Bani in AGGS. He wrote:

Mother Earth the Supreme, water as father and the wind is the Guru that supports life helping in communications.

The day is caretaker and playmate, and night working as a nurse helps hygiene and sleep; (the human working during day and sleeping at night) keeps the world going all the time.
The Nanakian Philosophy though, claims evolutionary development of human, but, there are some Sabds written by the Sikh Gurus that also relate physical body of human to earth/clay.

Why did Guru Nanak use the word ‘Musulman’ in the Sabd?
Guru Nanak comprehended the praxis of Islam and Brahmanism by the practitioners of both religions. He realized that they were entirely prejudiced and different than the preaching in their Holy books. The clergy practicing religions in traditional form depicted nothing more than a hidden and self deceiving façade. Guru Nanak had written several Sabds elaborating falsehood in the practice of Mullahs and Qazies and telling them correct tools and techniques of a perfect Musulman. He had realized the ‘Truth’, thus he gave credit to the Creator for knowing best of logic in creation, when he wrote;

"O’Nanak, the logic behind activity in the creation is best known to the Creator.
AGGS, M 1, p 466.

Thus, Guru Nanak applied the word ‘Musulman’ appropriately for the egoistic Islamic religious leaders promulgating Islamic superiority in divinity, piety, individuality (Allah is the only God), and Moslem supremacy as the chosen people by the Allah (Quran YA-112-1-4) [11]. He wanted to address these high headed Moslems, reminding them about their own sacred Holy script; relating it to the ‘Equality in humanity of all religions suffering through the worldly entrapments of Maya (material world, considered in reality to be an illusion) and emancipation only best known to the Creator of it all. Thus, The phrase ‘mittee Mussalmaan ki.” is a metaphorical substantiation of verse Al Hijr 15:26-29 in Holy Quran as explained.

Comprehensible Explication of ‘The Sabd’
The Sikh Gurus wrote Gurbani incorporated in the Aad Guru Granth Sahib (AGGS)[1], the Sikh Holy Scripture in the classical poetic form. They have used sophisticated vocabulary and complex syntax in writing precisely formed Sabds (hymns), so as to arouse subtleties of nature and socio-religious culture creating certain effects on human psyche. To fully appreciate complex feelings expressed in the Sabd, the person must examine its words and phrasing from the perspective of rhythm, images, obvious and implied meaning. An ‘explication’ simply translated means an explanation of how all the elements in a poem work together to achieve the actual meaning and effect. Highly accomplished poets use allusive references to something outside the poem that may be events or people from the history, mythology or religion. The Gurbani mostly illustrated in the form of metaphors, similes, analogies and personifications, represents theme or essence of the Sabd expressed in specific words.

Explication of ‘the Sabd’
“मित्ती मुसलमान की की व्याख्या में क्या क्या लगे?
(mittee Mussalmaan ki paiddae paiyee kumhihaar)- As explained earlier, Guru Nanak is referring to the origin of human according to Al Hijr 15:26-29 (Qur’an)[11] and addressing to the Islamic religious leaders, is reminding of their belief and wherefrom they originated. Even though the reference to kumhihaar in literal translation appears to be the ‘worldly potter’ and his trade of designing pots and pans etc. etc.; however, Guru Nanak is describing metaphorically, the Creator Supreme as ‘kumhihaar’ and the ability to create nature in enumerable forms. Specifically, Guru is referring to the creative activity surrounding Humans in various forms. Guru AmarDas supplemented philosophy of Guru Nanak by describing the universality of the Creator and varied forms of creation supported by the Creator Itself; when he wrote:

"अग्नि द्वारा भूमि विन्यस
The entire world is created from the same clay,
AGGS, M 3, p 1128.

"महुआ में खड़े कवि लोक के बाहर
Like the potter shaped all sorts of vessels.
"Again referring to the physical characteristics of wet wretched clay as a metaphor, burning in fire and demolishing sparks, Guru Nanak elaborates the physical, economical, social, moral and psychological state of humanity facing challenges in worldly entanglements (Maya). To understand the depth of this line, it would be better to review the Paurree 18 (stanza) in Jap ji, where Guru Nanak explained the anguish of countless effected cynics. He wrote:
Countless fools are lost in the dark of ignorance. Countless impose their will upon others. (Enforcing supremacy)

Countless are thieves & embezzlers.

Countless wretches survive on filth (drugs, alcohol, etc.).

Countless liars habitually keep spreading lies. (False witnesses)

Countless murderers hesitate not beheading others. (Tyrants)

As mentioned in the introductory remarks, Guru Arjan has synchronized the essence of Guru Nanak’s Sabd with the paurree 6 following Mahla 1 in Asa di Vaar that held fundamentals of Nanakian Philosophy. The paurree 6 stated below further augments theme of Guru Nanak elaborated in the Sabd. It says:

No body ever did and no body has ever realized the Truth, without the True Guru.

Because of the True Guru, revelations could be realized through the utterances.

those, who abandoned worldly attachments are liberated and through the Guru, attain eternal bliss.

This is supreme thought, that one's consciousness be attached to the True Lord.

then, the attributes of the Beneficent God are realized during life.

AGGS, M 1, p 466.

The logical expression of his theme is neither derogatory to any religious belief nor crediting supremacist views held by Islamic religious leaders. The Sabd does not support any thoughts in disposition of the human remains; rather it emphasizes the creative activity of the Creator and worldly life of the created-human.

CONCLUSIONS

In conclusion, Guru Nanak, applying the theme of a potter, his trade, the clay and its physical characteristics as metaphors, depicted in the Al: Hijr, Surah 15, vs.26 of the Quran; wrote the Sabd, ‘mittee Mussalmaan ki....’. He emphasized the universal phenomena of nature at
play in creation that is best known to the Creator alone. He signified the origin of humanity from one and the same source, even though it has variety of multiple colors, status, languages and genders. When exposed to heat in suffering from pains of life, every body is screaming mercy.

It is essential for every sensuous seeker of the Truth to thoroughly comprehend the certitude incorporated in the Holy Scripture. It is rather incumbent upon the honest and intelligent searcher to apply discrete analysis and logical interpretation to distinguish the Truth from the false. Apparently, reasonable consideration in the interpretation of the Sabd in discussion had been foiled from the very beginning; when the Islamic clerks in the court of Aurangzeb misinterpreted the Sabd. They did not comprehend the word ‘dirt/clay’ applied in the Sabd that it was neither intended for dirt of the grave nor it had to do anything with disposal of human remains according to the Islamic law. The alteration in the word ‘Musulman’ applied in the Sabd certainly pleased the Islamic clerks and hence the ruling King, but it also altered the history of Sikhism.

The composition of clay, history of pottery and the potter mentioned in the paper leaves no doubt that the true explication of the Sabd in the light of information obtained from the AH-15:26-29 (Holy Qur’an), was overdue.

In light of the newly comprehended interpretation of the Sabd, I would most humbly request the Sikh and Non-Sikh scholars, Sants, preachers, kirtinias and granthies to review the interpretation of the Sabd carefully. While discussing this Sabd, the questions raised in the paper and the facts revealed should be explained as in this paper. By doing so, there will not be any need either to apologize to other religions or to change wording in the Sabd.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS:
I would like to express my gratitude to Prof Devinder Singh Chahal and Dr Harbans Lal, whose expertise in the logical comprehension of Gurbani, patience and guidance in getting this paper completed. Their encouragement and support has been very helpful in reasonable interpretations of Gurbani.

REFERENCES:
1. AGGS=Aad Guru Granth Sahib 1983 (Reprint). Publishers: Shromani Gurdwara Parbandhak Committee, Amritsar. (M=Mahla i.e. succession number of the Sikh Gurus to the house of Nanak, M is replaced with the name of Bhagat/Bhatt for their Bani, p.-page of the AGGS).
3. Faridkot Wala Teeka, p. 1580; Search Gurbani.com
6. Khalsa, Sant Singh. Internet English Translation AGGS.
10. Nabha, Bhai Kahn Singh, Mahan Kosh, p. 1230-1, internet version