

DOES GURU NANAK SAY THE BANI (WORD) WAS REVEALED TO HIM BY GOD?

An In-Depth Study to Discover the Truth

ARTICLE

Prof Devinder Singh Chahal, PhD
Institute for Understanding Sikhism
Laval, Quebec, H7W 5L9
Email: sikhism@iuscanada.com

ਜੈਸੀ ਮੈ ਆਵੈ ਖਸਮ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ
ਤੈਸੜਾ ਕਰੀ ਗਿਆਨੁ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥
Jaisī mai āvai kḥasam kī baṇī
ṭaisṛā karī giān ve lālo.

ABSTRACT

Guru Nanak, the founder of Sikhi, is usually described as a mystic who had a mystical experience at the age of 27, 30, or 38 when he came out of the Vein rivulet after being missing for three days. Emerging from the water, he proclaimed, "There is no Hindu; there is no Muslim". This article attempts to refute this story by quoting the bani of Guru Nanak and on logical and scientific bases. Cunningham reported from a Persian manuscript, Siar ul Mutakharin that "Nanak was carefully educated by Saiyid Hasan and he also studied the most approved writings of Muhammadans and learned all the earthly sciences from Khizar, i.e. the prophet Elias". This article will emphasize that Guru Nanak was a well-educated and keen observer of the nature, the universe, and human behavior from an early age. He took long voyages to have intellectual discussions with the heads of various religious centers and institutes to promulgate his philosophy.

INTRODUCTION

All over the world, the 550th Birthday of Guru Nanak is being celebrated with full pomp and show during the year of 2019. The Governments of India and of Punjab will be spending hundreds of crores of rupees on this occasion. All the consulates of India in different countries will also be doing so. Similarly, many Sikh institutes and gurdwaras are also spending lots of money. The Union Minister Hardeep Singh Puri says that a 4km corridor will connect Dera Baba Nanak in Gurdaspur district with Gurdwara Kartarpur Sahib in Narowal, Pakistan. It will provide access for Sikh pilgrims to the historic shrine in the neighbouring country. This will be a befitting honor to Guru Nanak on his 550th Birthday and a friendship between two neighbors, India and Pakistan. [1]

The Institute for Understanding Sikhism (IUS) also announced an International Conference to celebrate the 550th Birthday of Guru Nanak on May 11, 2019 in Montreal. The theme of the IUS Conference was: **SIKHI FOUNDED BY GURU NANAK: WHAT HAPPENED AND WHAT SHOULD HAVE BEEN.** Unfortunately, the President of IUS was admitted to hospital for spinal surgery and this conference was cancelled.

There is a big question to be resolved by the Sikh intelligentsia during 2019 – the year of the 550th Birthday of Guru Nanak:

DOES GURU NANAK SAY THE BANI (WORD) WAS REVEALED TO HIM BY GOD?

Sikhi, founded by Guru Nanak, started to be continuously interpolated, misinterpreted and misrepresented under the influence of Vedic and Vedanta philosophies after the decease of Guru Nanak (1539). Recently, Sikhism has been criticized in one way or another by both Sikhs and non-Sikhs under different motives. These criticisms extend across a large portion of the beliefs and practices of Sikhism and even question the authenticity of the origin of the faith. One of the major criticisms is from scholar William Hewat McLeod, who cited the tension between the doctrine of God's transcendence in Sikhism and a supposed ability of God to communicate with people. McLeod says Sikh thinkers have been unable to give a convincing account of how God can communicate with people at all if this being is indeed transcendent. Although, this is what makes Sikh teachings different from other schools of thought (i.e., that God is transcendental, formless and infinite but still can communicate to people as if a physical being). [2]

McLeod is right to say that "Sikh thinkers have been unable to

give a convincing account of how God can communicate with people at all if this being is indeed transcendental, formless and infinite.” I have not come across any information where this issue has been resolved. I consulted some Sikh physicists and Sikh theologians, but could not get a satisfactory response. The following discussion may give an appropriate response to McLeod’s challenge to the Sikh scholars.

The main problem of the Sikh scholars is that they are heavily under the influence of Vedic and Vedanta philosophies since 1883 when the Aad Guru Granth, called Faridkot Vala Teeka, first interpreted by the Nirmalas, was published. [3] The Sikh scholars have not been able to escape this influence even during the 21st century of science. Moreover, Sikh scholars feel that the draconian sword of excommunication is always hanging over their heads if they speak or write against the Sikh establishment. Many such excommunications by the Jathedar of the Akal Takht are on record.

Guru Nanak is usually described as a mystic, who had spiritual experiences at the age of 27, 30, and 38 when he came out of the Vein rivulet after being missing for three days. Emerging from the water, he proclaimed, “There is no Hindu; there is no Muslim”. Chahal et al [4] have refuted such stories in the e-book, Nanak: The *Guru – Founder of Sikhism*. In this book, they emphasize that Guru Nanak was a very keen observer of the nature, the universe, and human behavior and started to formulate his philosophy from an early age. They also recommend that those who want to know about Nanak and his philosophy should look for it in his bani (hymns/ verses) incorporated in the Aad Guru Granth Sahib (AGGS). [5]

In the Sikh Bulletin of November-December 2018 following two articles appeared:

**IS GURU NANAK’S PARKASH DAY DIFFERENT FROM GURU NANAK’S BIRTH DAY?
YES, IT IS.**

Harbans Lal, Ph.D.; D.Litt. (Hons) and Ek Onkaar Kaur Khalsa Michaud
IS GURU NANAK’S PARKASH DAY DIFFERENT FROM GURU NANAK’S BIRTH DAY?

NO, IT ISN’T.
Karminder Singh, PhD (Boston)

The above claim of Lal and Michaud [6] was refuted in details by quoting pertinent bani from the Aad Guru Granth Sahib (AGGS), Vaaran of Bhai Gurdas, and other sources by Karminder Singh [7] in his above article # 2.

Lal and Michaud [6, 8] accept that “...prominent historians such as Gyani M.A. Macauliffe, Hew McLeod, Kahn Singh Nabha, Indu Bhushan Banerji, Khushwant Singh, Kirpal Singh, Ganda Singh, Harbans Singh, H.R. Gupta, Principal Satbir Singh, and others accept April (1469) as the date of the birth of Guru Nanak. Thus, April 2019 will be Guru Nanak’s 550th birth anniversary. The global Sikh community is preparing in various ways to celebrate this auspicious day. But, they say, **“However, Guru Nanak’s birth day is not the same as his Prakash day.”** They continue to write that “at his birth, Guru Nanak’s destiny to spread Divine Wisdom was not recognized either by his parents or the community around him; with the possible exception of Rai Bullar who was the head administrator of the town where Guru Nanak was born.

Nevertheless, they do admit that **“Only Rai Bullar recognized his wisdom from the time of Birth.”**

They continue to say that “the nine Gurus who followed Guru Nanak and the Guru Panth (Sikh community throughout the world) have traditionally celebrated Guru Nanak’s birthday on Vaisakhi in a variety of ways. The celebrations included spiritual services as well as holding of conferences, teaching retreats, and launching of new books or other initiatives.”

They then quote Bhai Gurdas, the Sikh theologian of the highest recognition in Sikh history, describing Guru Nanak Parkash in Var 1, Pauri (stanza) # 27 by the following verses:

“ਸਤਿਗੁਰ ਨਾਨਕ ਪ੍ਰਗਟਿਆ ਮਿਟੀ ਯੁੰਧ ਜਗ
ਚਾਨਣ ਹੋਆ॥

ਜਿਉਂ ਕਰ ਸੂਰਜ ਨਿਕਲਿਆ ਤਾਰੇ ਛਪੇ ਅੰਧੇਰ
ਪਲੇਆ॥

Satguru Nanak pragatai miti dhundhu jagi
chananu hoa.

Jiu kar suraju nikalia tare chhapi andheru
paloa.

They interpreted this phrase as follows:
With the emergence of the Eternal Guru Nanak, the mist (metaphor for multiple factions toeing the religiosity by clergies) cleared and the light (true enlightening wisdom) sprinkled all around.
As if at the sun rise the stars disappeared and the darkness dispelled.

However, this pauri (stanza) is generally interpreted as follows [9]:

ਸਤਿਗੁਰ ਨਾਨਕ ਪ੍ਰਗਟਿਆ

ਮਿਟੀ ਯੁੰਧੁ ਜਗਿ ਚਾਨਣੁ ਹੋਆ॥

ਜਿਉ ਕਰਿ ਸੂਰਜੁ ਨਿਕਲਿਆ

ਤਾਰੇ ਛਪਿ ਅੰਧੇਰੁ ਪਲੇਆ॥

Satiguru Naanaku Pragataia Mitee
Dhundhu Jagi Chaanau Hoaa |
Jiu Kari Sooraju Nikaliaa Taaray Chhipay
Andhyru Palooa |

ਵਾਰਾਂ ਭਾਈ ਗੁਰਦਾਸ : ਵਾਰ ੧ ਪਉੜੀ ੨੭ ਪੰ. ੨

With the emergence of the true Guru Nanak, the mist cleared and the light scattered all around.

As if at the sun rise the stars disappeared and the darkness dispelled.

Vaaran Bhai Gurdas; Vaar 1, Pauri 27.

Nevertheless, Bhai Gurdas does not specify when it happened. Was it when Guru Nanak was born in April, or when he was enlightened after emerging out of the Vein rivulet during Pooranmashi (full moon night) of Kartik, Lunar month after 27 years (discussed in detail later)?

Reference to Parkash Day of Guru Nanak Lal and Michaud [8] continue to describe Parkash Day of Guru Nanak as follows:
“One morning, Guru Nanak disappeared

into the river (Vein rivulet) and spent, it is said, three days in meditation. He re-emerged in a divine trance, reportedly, and as soon as he came out of that trance, he said he had a vision, a revelation. The revelation inspired him to teach the world that a Divine Presence permeates the universe. That religions were only man-made and should not be employed to profile and divide people. This reference was about Hindus and Muslim, the two major religions in the area. It was the night of the full moon in **November 1496** (some historians report the year to be 1499) that he emerged from his meditation. **On this day Guru Nanak began to claim in more than one way that the Creator had summoned him and assigned him the mission of sharing this divine message to all humanity.** He claimed to have received the message directly from the ONE in a state of heightened consciousness, and he taught it to people by singing it in inspired hymns. There are many famous verses of his pronouncements including the commencing verse of Sri Guru Granth Sahib, popularly known as Mool Mantar. This hymn begins with a symbol to serve as Sikh insignia. The symbol of Ek Onkaar is popularly translated as the One Reality (Force) that is manifested in all creation." Harbans Lal and Roshan Attrey again confirm the revelation to Guru Nanak by God in their new book. [10]

Change of Guru Nanak's Birthday from April to Pooranmashi of Kartik

Lal and Michaud [8] also report that it was Bhai Sant Singh Gyani, who in connivance of Maharaja Ranjit Singh, was able to convince the Sikhs that the Birthday of Guru Nanak should be celebrated on the Pooranmashi of Kartik instead of in April. He argued this would result in more gatherings and offerings of money at Amritsar because the Hindus celebrate a festival at Ram Tirath about 5 miles away at the same time. Since then, Sikhs have forgotten to celebrate the birthday of Guru Nanak in April. Now, it is celebrated on the Pooranmashi of Kartik all over the world.

Chahal, et al. [4] have refuted this

episode of the disappearance of Guru Nanak in the Vein rivulet as follows:

In Search of Truth

According to Prof John Bowker, editor, The Oxford Dictionary of World Religions, "... that revelation is always contingent—that is, no matter how strong the claims may be that a particular text or collection of texts comes from heaven or from God, it is always related to the particular historical circumstances in which it first appeared. And that means, in turn, that it is related to the transmission of a particular system." [11]

In almost all religions, it is necessary to connect their prophet to God for revelation in one way or another. Therefore, early Sikh writers have concocted such stories as discussed here in this article.

This has also been quoted by Noor in his book, *Connecting the Dots in Sikh History*, ([12], p 21) to relate it to the story about the disappearance of Guru Nanak in the Vein rivulet:

"After resigning his job as Modi of Daulit Khan Lodi's Modikhana (Government Store) Nanak was spending more and more time in meditation and seclusion. **One day in August 1499, after the monsoon rains,** he went for a bath in Vein, a rivulet, which flowed past the town of Sultanpur. He swam upstream for meditation in his favourite place in the wilderness near the riverbank. **He was missing for three days.** With his clothes lying on the riverbank, people believed he had drowned. Friends and family were miserable, unable to hold their tears; they hoped and prayed for the safe return. But Nanak, in quest of truth, after a mystical experience, full of inspiration and a clear vision, returned to Sultanpur, with a glow on his face and *Na ko Hindu, na ko Musalman** on his lips. 'Where were you Nanak?' They asked. *Na ko Hindu, na ko Musalman*, was his cryptic answer to that and every other question."

*There is neither a Hindu nor a Muslim.

Dawe [13] also narrated this story that "one day Guru Nanak failed to appear for work following his early morning ablutions at the bank of the river Vein which flowed past the town of Sultanpur. He had been missing for three days and nights, and it was feared that he had drowned. Rapt contemplation of God had brought him to an **intimate communion with the Divine.** He seemed to have received a call to go forth into the wider world to preach the vision vouchsafed to him. The *Puratan Janam Sakhi* describes his mystical experience in terms of **direct encounter with the Divine;** also, Bhai Gurdas [14] who says, Vaar, 1.24, that Guru Nanak was invested with his commission in *Sach Khand*, the Abode of the Eternal One. The first words Guru Nanak uttered on reappearance were: "There is no Hindu, there is no Musalman."

This story is also accepted by the SGPC. At the age of 38, on August 1507, Guru Nanak Sahib heard God's call to dedicate himself to the service of humanity after bathing in the Vein rivulet near Sultanpur Lodhi. The very first sentence which he uttered then was, "There is no Hindu, no Musalman" [15].

Udham Singh, on the other hand, emphasized that Guru Nanak uttered 'Waheguru', 'Waheguru' after appearing from the Vein rivulet ([16], p 54). In some stories, Guru Nanak uttered the 'Mool Mantra', while in others, he recited the whole 'JAP', the first bani. In some stories, he remained in water for three days. The year is 1507 in some stories, while in others it is 1497 or 1499. There are many diverse opinions on this episode; however, it appears that this story of missing in Vein rivulet tells us that for three days Guru Nanak was actually in the court of God where he attained a revelation.

Noor's story [12] is quite different than that of Lal and Michaud [8]. Noor says that it was the rainy season of August, but Lal and Michaud say it was

pooranmashi of Kartik (November). The utterance of Guru Nanak after emerging out of the Vein rivulet reported by Noor, Lal and Michaud and as observed by Chahal, et al. [4], Dawe [13], SGPC [15], Udham Singh [16] and others about this story are quite different.

A question to the Sikh intelligentsia:
Should we, the Sikhs, believe such stories?

Many Sikh scholars like Noor have tried to prove that Nanak received a revelation or enlightenment at the age of 30 when he came out of the Vein rivulet as if he had no prior visions or knowledge of spirituality. Noor ([12], p-21-24) has tried unsuccessfully to justify the above statement as truly said by Nanak. On the other hand, some scholars have tried to justify the episode at the Vein rivulet and the disappearance of Nanak for three days by quoting the following verse of Guru Nanak, saying that during these three days Nanak was in the court of God:

ਹਉ ਢਾਢੀ ਵੇਕਾਰੁ ਕਾਰੈ ਲਾਇਆ ॥

Ha^o dhādhī vekār kārāi lāi^oā.

ਰਾਤਿ ਦਿਰੈ ਕੈ ਵਾਰੁ ਧੁਰੁ ਫੁਰਮਾਇਆ ॥

Rāt dīhai kai vār dhurahu furmāi^oā.

ਢਾਢੀ ਸਚੈ ਮਹਲਿ ਖਸਮਿ ਬੁਲਾਇਆ ॥

Dhādhī sachai mahal khasam bulāi^oā.

ਸਚੀ ਸਿਫਤਿ ਸਾਲਾਹ ਕਪੜਾ ਪਾਇਆ ॥

Sachī sifaṭ sālāh kapṛā pāi^oā.

ਸਚਾ ਅੰਮ੍ਰਿਤ ਨਾਮੁ ਭੋਜਨੁ ਆਇਆ ॥

Sachā amrit nām bhōjan āi^oā.

ਗੁਰਮਤੀ ਖਾਧਾ ਰਜਿ ਤਿਨਿ ਸੁਖੁ ਪਾਇਆ

Gurmaṭī khādhā raj tīn sukh pāi^oā.

ਢਾਢੀ ਕਰੇ ਪਸਾਉ ਸਬਦੁ ਵਜਾਇਆ ॥

Dhādhī kare pasā^o sabad vajāi^oā.

ਨਾਨਕ ਸਚੁ ਸਾਲਾਹਿ ਪੂਰਾ ਪਾਇਆ ॥੨੭॥ ਸੁਧੁ ॥

Nānak sach sālāhi pūrā pāi^oā. ||27||

sudhū

ਅਗਗਸ, ਮ: 1, ਪੰਨਾ 150 (AGGS, M 1, p 150) [5].

Its literal Translation by Manmohan Singh (SGPC, Publication) from “sriganth.org” is given as follows [17]. However, there is great need to interpret it in its real

perspective to discover the real message of Guru Nanak in this verse:

“Me, the bard out of work, the Lord has applied to His service.

In the very beginning, He gave me the order to sing His praises night and day.

The Master summoned the minstrel to His True Court.

He clothed me with the robe of His true Honour and eulogy.

Since then the True Name has become my ambrosial food.

They, who under the Guru's instruction eat this food to their satisfaction, obtain peace.

By singing the Guru's hymns, I the minstrel spread the Lord's glory.

Nanak, by praising the True Name I have obtained the perfect Lord.”

Sant Singh interpreted the same as follows copied from “sriganth.org” [17]:

“I was without any work but God engaged me as minister (minstrel).

When God summoned me in Its true court, God ordained me right from the beginning whether it is day or night praise (the God).

God dressed me with the robe of truth.

God served me the food, the elixir of Naam.

Those Guru-oriented who ate this food (of Naam) attained all the pleasures and peace.

Now I, the minister, is disseminating the teachings loudly.

Nanak has attained the Perfect (God) by praising the True God.”

If we look into the above verse critically, we do not find even the slightest hint to indicate that Guru Nanak was missing for three days in the Vein rivulet, nor could we justify that Guru Nanak could have said, “Na ko Hindu na ko Musلمان”, utter the “Mool Mantra”, recite the “JAP”, or utter “Waheguru”.

Moreover, the research of Chahal et al. [4] of the Gurbani indicates that Guru Nanak did not declare “Na ko Hindu, na ko Musلمان” (neither there is a Hindu nor a Muslim) nor any similar statement in his bani incorporated in the AGGS.

However, it was Guru Arjun who has said it in an entirely different way: “Na hum Hindu na Musلمان” (“I am neither a Hindu nor a Muslim”) in his following verse ([18] p 16-17):

ਵਰਤ¹ ਨ ਰਹਉ² ਨ ਮਹ ਰਮਦਾਨਾ³ ॥

varaṭ na raha^o na mah ramdānā.

ਤਿਸੁ⁴ ਸੇਵੀ⁵ ਜੋ ਰਖੈ ਨਿਦਾਨਾ⁶ ॥੧॥

Ṭis sevī jo rakhai nidānā. ||1||

ਏਕੁ⁷ ਗੁਸਾਈ⁸ ਅਲਹੁ⁹ ਮੇਰਾ ॥

Ēk gusāi^o alhu merā.

ਹਿੰਦੂ¹⁰ ਤੁਰਕ¹¹ ਦੁਹਾ ਨੇਬੇਰਾ¹² ॥੧॥ ਰਹਾਉ ॥

Hindū ṭurak duhān neberā. ||1|| rahā^o.

ਹਜ¹³ ਕਾਬੈ ਜਾਉ ਨ ਤੀਰਥ¹⁴ ਪੂਜਾ¹⁵ ॥

Haj kābai jā^o na ṭirath pūjā.

ਏਕੇ ਸੇਵੀ ਅਵਰੁ ਨ ਦੂਜਾ ॥੨॥

Ēko sevī avar na dūjā. ||2||

ਪੂਜਾ ਕਰਉ ਨ ਨਿਵਾਜ ਗੁਜਾਰਉ¹⁶ ॥

Pūjā kara^o na nivāj gujāra^o.

ਏਕ ਨਿਰੰਕਾਰ¹⁷ ਲੇ ਰਿਦੈ¹⁸ ਨਮਸਕਾਰਉ¹⁹ ॥੩॥

Ēk nirānkār le ridai namaskāra^o. ||3||

ਨਾ ਹਮ ਹਿੰਦੂ ਨ ਮੁਸਲਮਾਨ ॥

Nā ham hindū na musalmān.

ਅਲਹ ਰਾਮ ਕੇ ਪਿੰਡੂ²⁰ ਪਰਾਨ²¹ ॥੪॥

Alah rām ke piṇḍū parān. ||4||

ਕਹੁ ਕਬੀਰ ਇਹੁ ਕੀਆ ਵਖਾਨਾ²² ॥

Kaho Kabīr ih kīā vakhānā.

ਗੁਰ ਪੀਰ ਮਿਲਿ²³ ਖੁਦਿ²⁴ ਖਸਮੁ²⁵ ਪਛਾਨਾ

॥੫॥੩॥

Gur pīr mil khud khasam pachhānā. ||5||3||

ਅਗਗਸ, ਮ: 5, ਪੰਨਾ 1136.

I do not practice² the fasts¹ (of Hindus), nor do I observe the month of Ramadaan³ (the Roza³).

I serve⁵ only the One⁴, who protects all till the end of life⁶. 1.

My God is only One⁷, Who is called Gosain⁸ (by the Hindus) and Allah⁹ (by the Muslims).

I have separated¹² myself from (religious practices) of them both, the Hindus¹⁰ and the Muslims¹¹. Pause.

I do not make pilgrimages¹³ to Mecca, nor do my worship¹⁵ at Hindu sacred shrines¹⁴.

I serve no other than the Only One. 2.

I do not perform Hindu worship, nor do I offer¹⁶ the Muslim prayers. I have understood in my mind¹⁸ and pay my obeisance¹⁹ to the One, the Formless¹⁷. 3.

I am neither a Hindu, nor a Muslim.

My body²⁰ and life²¹ belong to the One (who is) Allah (for Muslims) and Ram (for Hindus). 4.

Oh Kabir! This is what I say²²:

That the one-self²⁴ can realize²⁶ the God²⁵ through Guru - Pir (Spiritual Teacher)²³. 5. 3.

AGGS, M 5, p 1136. ([18] p 16-17)

In the above verse, Guru Arjun, based on the philosophy of Guru Nanak, declared, "I am neither a Hindu nor a Muslim". This is Nanakian Philosophy— that the Sikh Gurus and the disciples (the Sikhs) of Guru Nanak are neither Hindus nor Muslims.

Before Guru Arjun, Bhagat Kabir had alienated himself from the practices of the Hindus and the Muslims:

ਉਲਟਿ ਜਾਤਿ ਕੁਲ ਦੇਉ ਬਿਸਾਰੀ ॥

Ulat jāṭ kul dōṁ bisārī.

ਮੁੰਨ ਸਹਜ ਮਹਿ ਬੁਨਤ ਹਮਾਰੀ ॥੧॥

Sunn sahj meh bunat hamārī. ||1|

ਹਮਰਾ ਝਗਰਾ ਰਹਾ ਨ ਕੇਉ ॥

Hamrā jhagrā rahā na koṁ.

ਪੰਡਿਤ ਮੁਲਾ ਛਾਡੇ ਦੇਉ ॥੧॥ ਰਹਾਉ ॥

Pandit mulāñ chhāḍe dōṁ. ||1|| rahāṁo.

ਬੁਨਿ ਬੁਨਿ ਆਪ ਆਪੁ ਪਹਿਰਾਵਉ ॥

Bun bun āp āp pahirāvāṁo.

ਜਹ ਨਹੀ ਆਪੁ ਤਹਾ ਹੋਇ ਗਾਵਉ ॥੨॥

Jah nahī āp tahā hoṁe gāvāṁo. ||2||

ਪੰਡਿਤ ਮੁਲਾ ਜੋ ਲਿਖਿ ਦੀਆ ॥

Pandit mulāñ jo likhī dīā.

ਛਾਡਿ ਚਲੇ ਹਮ ਕਛੂ ਨ ਲੀਆ ॥੩॥

Chhāḍ chhale ham kachhū na līā. ||3||

ਰਿਦੈ ਇਖਲਾਸੁ ਨਿਰਖਿ ਲੇ ਮੀਰਾ ॥

Ridai ikhlās nirakhī le mīrā.

ਆਪੁ ਖੋਜਿ ਖੋਜਿ ਮਿਲੇ ਕਬੀਰਾ ॥੪॥੭॥

Āp kḥoj kḥoj mile kabīrā. ||4||7||

ਅਗਗਸ, ਕਬੀਰ, ਪੰਨਾ 1158-1159.

AGGS, Kabir, p 1158-1159.

Here is the literal translation by Dr. Sant Singh Khalsa from "SriGranth.org"[17]:

"Turning away from the world, I have forgotten both my social class and ancestry.

My weaving now is in the most profound celestial stillness. 1.

I have no quarrel with anyone. I have abandoned both the Pandits, the Hindu religious scholars, and the Mullahs, the Muslim priests. 1.

I weave and weave, and wear what I weave. Where egotism does not exist, there I sing God's Praises. 2.

Whatever the Pandits and Mullahs have written, I reject; I do not accept any of it. 3.

My heart is pure, and so I have seen the Lord within.

Searching, searching within the self, Kabeer has met the Lord. 4. 7."

AGGS, Kabir, p 1158-59.

Both verses of Guru Arjun and of Bhagat Kabir do not support the statement, "There is no Hindu, no Musalman". The emphasis is that neither Guru Arjun nor Bhagat Kabir accepted or practiced any concept of Hinduism or of Islam.

Now it becomes the duty of the Sikh intelligentsia to look into the above verse, ਹਉ ਢਾਢੀ ਵੇਕਾਰੁ ਕਾਰੈ ਲਾਇਆ ॥

(Haṁo dhādhī vekār kārāi lāiā.) ["Me, the bard out of work, the Lord has applied to His service."], which ends with a word, ਸੁਧੁ (sudhu). The word ਸੁਧੁ

(sudhu) means correct or corrected. It has been added at the end of this verse by Guru Arjun, perhaps during editing as if there was something not right. There is another phrase in this verse, ਢਾਢੀ ਸਚੈ ਮਹਲਿ ਖਸਮਿ ਬੁਲਾਇਆ ॥ Dhādhī sachai mahal kḥasam bulāiā, which indicates that Dhadhi (Nanak) was summoned in the court of God.

There is another big question: Is there a special court of God somewhere on Earth or on any other planet in the universe?

No not at all.

Guru Nanak himself questions the existence of such a court in JAP Bani in stanza # 27 as follows:

ਸੇ ਦਰੁ ਕੇਹਾ ਸੇ ਘਰੁ ਕੇਹਾ ਜਿਤੁ ਬਰਿ ਸਰਬ ਸਮਾਲੇ ॥

So dar kehā so ghar kehā jīt bahi sarab samāle.

Where is the gate¹ of that dwelling² in which³ the Eternal Entity resides⁴ and controls⁵ every action and reaction⁵ (in the whole Universe)? 27-1

Guru Nanak himself answers the Eternal Entity (God) is pervading everywhere:

ਜਿਹ ਧਿਰਿ¹² ਦੇਖਾ ਤਿਹ ਧਿਰਿ¹³ ਮਉਜੁਦੁ¹⁴ ॥੧॥

Jih dhīr dekḥā tih dhīr maṁujūd. ||1|

ਅਗਗਸ, ਮ: 1, ਪੰਨਾ 84.

Wherever¹² I look, You (Eternal Entity) are pervading¹⁴ everywhere¹³.

AGGS, M 1, p 83-84.

Guru Nanak further says that the Eternal Entity (God) is also inaccessible:

ਤੂ ਕਰਤਾ¹ ਪੁਰਖੁ¹ ਅਗੰਮੁ² ਹੈ ਰਵਿਆ³ ਸਭ ਠਾਈ⁴ ॥

Tū kartā purakh agamm hai raviā sabḥ ṭhāī.

ਅਗਗਸ, ਮ: 1, ਪੰਨਾ 1291.

You, the Creating force¹, are inaccessible² and pervading³ everywhere⁴.

AGGS, M 1, p 1291.

And

ਅਗਮ¹ ਅਗੋਚਰੁ² ਅਲਖੁ³ ਹੈ ਗੁਰਮੁਖਿ⁴ ਹਰਿ ਜਾਣੁ ॥੧੧॥

Agam agochar alakḥ hai gurmukḥ har jāṇ. ||11|

ਅਗਗਸ, ਮ: 1, ਪੰਨਾ 789.

That Eternal Entity (God) is inaccessible¹, ineffable/unfathomable² and unseen³;

Oh Guru-oriented⁴! Understand this fact of that Eternal Entity.

AGGS, M 1, p 789.

All the above phrases of Guru Nanak confirm that there is no such place like a court for the Eternal Entity since that Entity is everywhere, inaccessible, ineffable and unseen. If that Eternal Entity (God) has such characteristics, then there

is no way that anybody can have a revelation from that Eternal Entity.

Then how was Guru Nanak Enlightened?

Dawe [13] also narrated the above story, but he described Nanak “as a precocious child, showing early maturity of mind, who even at the age of five questioned the purpose of life. On the other hand, he was a dreamy child often indifferent to his studies and inattentive to everyday duties. He did not settle for the routine observance of rituals and rules. He refused to wear janeu, sacred thread worn around the neck and under one arm at the age of about 8 or 9, a ritual to initiate a person as a Hindu. His family was worried that Nanak was emotionally or physically ill. **A physician was summoned who declared after examining him that he does not need any healing but was set for healing others.** His father decided to send him to his sister, Nanaki, and her husband, Jai Ram, at Sultanpur where he served as keeper of modikhana, a government storehouse, of Nawab Daulat Khan Lodhi. He fulfilled his duties and won admiration of everyone for his diligence. He served for more than 12 years as a keeper of the government provision store. But he was not satisfied with this job.”

Moreover, Cunningham ([19] note # 2, p 35) reported from a Persian manuscript, Siar ul Mutakharin, that “Nanak was carefully educated by Saiyid Hasan and he also studied the most approved writings of Muhammadans and learned all the **earthly sciences** from Khizar, i.e. the prophet Elias. **It indicates that Nanak had a great vision right from the beginning and refused to accept various rituals and religious rules being practiced at his time. He started to discover the truth through dialogue with his primary school teachers and later took long voyages to have intellectual discussions with heads of various religious centers and institutes.**”

The above observations by Dawe [13] and Cunningham [19] about the early life of Guru Nanak clearly indicate that we cannot pinpoint a particular time of

enlightenment/revelation to Guru Nanak as is explained in the disappearance in the Vein rivulet at the age of about 27, 30, or 38 years. Rather, it was a continuous process of revelation right from the beginning of his life. Karam Singh, a Sikh historian, [20] says that there are many illogical and unscientific stories fabricated about the life of Guru Nanak.

DID GOD REVEAL THE BANI (WORD) TO GURU NANAK?

This concept of God being transcendental, formless, inaccessible and infinite and still revealing bani to the Sikh Guru is based on the wrong interpretation of the following phrase of Guru Arjun:

ਧੁਰ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਆਈ ॥

Dhur kī banī āī.

ਤਿਨਿ ਸਗਲੀ ਚਿੰਤ ਮਿਟਾਈ ॥

Ṭin saglī chint mitāī.

AGGS, M 5, p 628.

Manmohan Singh: [17]

From the primal One, has emanated the Gurbani, and it has effaced all the anxiety.

Sant Singh Khalsa: [17]

The Bani of His Word emanated from the Primal Lord. It eradicates all anxiety.

Prof Sahib Singh: [17]

ਰੇ ਸੰਤ ਜਨੇ! ਪਰਮਾਤਮਾ ਦੀ ਸਿਫਤ-ਸਾਲਾਹ ਦੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਜਿਸ ਮਨੁੱਖ ਦੇ ਅੰਦਰ ਆ ਵੱਸੀ, ਉਸ ਨੇ ਆਪਣੀ ਸਾਰੀ ਚਿੰਤਾ ਦੂਰ ਕਰ ਲਈ।

(English) *Oh Noble people! When the praise worthy bani of God is imbibed by someone then he becomes anxiety free.*

The possible correct interpretation could be as follows:

Guru Arjun says that:

The Bani has come to me from the ਧੁਰ

(Dhur) – (the principle place where Guru Nanak promulgated his bani or from Guru Nanak, the founder of Sikhi).

That Bani has eradicated all my anxiety.

Note: ਧੁਰ (Dhur): Mahan Kosh Encyclopedia: [17]

ਸੰ. ਸੰਗਯਾ. ਗੱਡੀ ਰਥ ਆਦਿ ਦੀ ਉਹ ਕੀਲੀ, ਜਿਸ ਪੁਰ ਪਹੀਆ ਫਿਰਦਾ ਹੈ. ਅਕਸ਼ axis। (2) ਪ੍ਰਧਾਨ ਅਸਥਾਨ. ਮੁੱਖ ਜਗਾ. "ਧੁਰ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਆਈ". (ਸੇਰ ਮਃ ੫)। (3) ਭਾਰ. ਬੋਝ। (4) ਆਰੰਭ. ਮੁੱਢ. "ਧੁਰਦੁ ਵਿਛੁੰਨੀ ਕਿਉ ਮਿਲੈ?" (ਸ੍ਰੀ ਮਃ ੧)। (5) ਗੱਡੇ ਰਥ ਆਦਿ ਦਾ ਜੂਲਾ, ਜਿਸ ਨਾਲ ਬੈਲ ਘੋੜੇ ਆਦਿ ਜੋੜੇ ਜਾਂਦੇ ਹਨ। (6) ਧਨ। (7) ਪ੍ਰਾਣ.

English: The axis on which the wheel rotates, **principle place of origin**, beginning, yoke, wealth, life.

According to Dictionary.com axis means the line about which a rotating body, such as the earth, turns.

Here ਧੁਰ (Dhur) mean the principle place of origin (i.e. from Kartarpur, District Narowal, Pakistan wherefrom Guru Nanak, founder of Sikhi, promulgated Sikhi).

This is the main phrase by Guru Arjun which makes the Sikhs believe that God revealed the bani (Dhur Ki Bani) to Guru Nanak and other Sikh Gurus. Consequently, Rabinder Singh Bhamra (Gurmat Learning Zone # 141438, 10-05-2017) declared that:

“This is for the information of all the members that the entire Gurbani of Guru Granth Sahib is DKB, (Dhur Ki Bani) including the Bani of Bhagats, Bhattas and some Gursikhs. They were all one with God and narrated Gurbani in their own style bit (but) it is Gurbani.”

Although there are some more such phrases by Sikh Gurus, Guru Nanak has not admitted anywhere that God revealed the bani to him, except in a sabd, ਹਉ ਢਾਢੀ ਵੇਕਾਰੁ ਕਾਰੈ ਲਾਇਆ ॥ Ha=0 dhādhī vekār kārāi lāīā, which has already been discussed. In spite of that, many Sikh theologians quote the following phrase to justify that God did reveal the bani to Guru Nanak:

ਜੈਸੀ ਮੈ ਆਵੈ ਖਸਮ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਤੈਸੜਾ ਕਰੀ ਗਿਆ
ਨੁ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥

Jaisī mai āvai kḥasam kī baṇī ṭaisṛā karī
gī=ān ve lālo.

As the word of the Lord comes to me, so
do I utter, O Lalo.

AGGS, M 1, p 722. Translated by
Manmohan Singh. [17] Many other
interpret it so.

Notes:

ਖਸਮ (English: God, controller, owner,
husband, enemy, friend, relative, anger,
etc.)

However, in the above phrase, **ਖਸਮ**
(khasam) means ‘controller’ as explained
by Guru Nanak in the following phrase:

ਖੁਰਾਸਾਨ¹ ਖਸਮਾਨਾ² ਕੀਆ ਹਿੰਦੁਸਤਾਨੁ³
ਡਰਾਇਆ⁴ ॥

khuraasaan kḥasmaanaa kee-aa
hindusataan daraa-i-aa.

AGGS, M 1, p 360.

After handing over the control² of
Khuraasaan¹ to somebody, Babar
terrified⁴ Hindustan³ (India).

Similarly, Guru Arjun also explains **ਖਸਮ**
(khasa) as ‘owner/controller’ in the
following stanza:

ਜਿਉ ਰਾਖਾ ਖੇਤ ਉਪਰਿ ਪਰਾਏ ॥

ji-o raakḥaa khayṭ oopar paraa-ay.

ਖੇਤੁ ਖਸਮ ਕਾ ਰਾਖਾ ਉਠਿ ਜਾਏ ॥

khayṭ kḥasam kaa raakḥaa uṭh jaa-ay.

The hired watchman protects the field of
crop from any damage, however, this
crop belongs to the Khasam (owner/
controller), and the watchman leaves
when the crop is ready to be harvested.

ਉਸੁ ਖੇਤ ਕਾਰਣਿ ਰਾਖਾ ਕੜੈ ॥

us khayṭ kaaran raakḥaa karḥai.

ਤਿਸ ਕੈ ਪਾਲੈ ਕਛੁ ਨ ਪੜੈ ॥੩॥

tis kai paalai kachhoo na parḥai. ||3||

The watch man worked very hard to
protect the crop from damage, but
nothing was left in his hand (except little
money for that labor). ||3||

AGGS, M 5, p 179.

ਲਾਲੇ (Lalo): In the Sikh literature, ਲਾਲੇ
(Lalo) is the name of a carpenter in
Saidpur (Aminabad) with whom Guru
Nanak stayed. However, according to
Gurbani, ਲਾਲੇ (Lalo) means ‘beloved’ as
follows:

ਨਾ ਮੈਲਾ¹ ਨਾ ਧੁੰਧਲਾ² ਨਾ ਭਗਵਾ³ ਨਾ ਕਚੁ⁴ ॥

naa mailaa naa DhunDhlaa naa bhagvaa
naa kach.

ਨਾਨਕ ਲਾਲੇ⁵ ਲਾਲੁ⁶ ਹੈ ਸਚੈ⁷ ਰਤਾ ਸਚੁ⁸ ॥੧॥

naanak laalo laal hai sachai raṭaa sach.
||1||

Nanak says that his Beloved (God)⁵
neither gets dirty¹ nor becomes dull² nor
appears in saffron³ nor fades⁴ away
since That Jewel (Beloved God)⁶ truly⁷
exists⁸ forever.

AGGS, M 1, p 1089.

And

So says Guru Arjun that ਲਾਲੇ (Lalo)

means beloved:

ਲਾਲੁ¹ ਅਮੋਲਾ² ਲਾਲੇ³ ॥

laal amolaa laalo.

ਅਗਰ⁴ ਅਤੇਲਾ⁵ ਨਾਮੇ⁶ ॥੧॥ ਰਹਾਉ ॥

agah aṭolaa naamo. ||1|| rahaa-o.

My Beloved (God)³ is like a priceless²
jewel¹ since That (God)³ is inaccessible⁴
and immeasurable⁵ against all others⁶

AGGS, M 5, p 1006.

The above phrase was translated by
Manmohan Singh, SGPC, as most others
have done. However, by keeping in view
the etymological meanings of “Khasam”
as “controller”, the one who has
controlling power in this case is the
“BRAIN”. The brain controls all the
functions in the body through the
network of the nervous system which
passes through the spinal cord and is
distributed throughout the body at
various places. Thoughts originate by
chemical and physical reactions, and
electrical impulses by neurons in the
brain from observations. It is the brain
that sees activities through the eyes, it
is the brain that analyses the scene, and
it is the brain that converts the result of
that analysis into speech, which is
uttered by the mouth. “Lalo” means the
“all beloved ones” rather than a certain

person, Bhai Lalo. Under these
circumstances, I would interpret that
phrase as follows:

ਜੈਸੀ ਮੈ ਆਵੈ ਖਸਮ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਤੈਸੜਾ ਕਰੀ ਗਿਆ
ਨੁ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥

Jaisī mai āvai kḥasam kī baṇī ṭaisṛā karī
gī=ān ve lālo.

AGGS, M 1, p 722.

O’ my beloved ones (Lalo), I am explaining
(what has happened) as has been seen by
my eyes and analysed by my brain
(Khasam) to say so.

This phrase is followed by complete sabd
of Guru Nanak as follows:

ਪਾਪ ਕੀ ਜੰਵ ਲੈ ਕਾਬਲਹੁ ਧਾਇਆ ਜੇਰੀ ਮੰਗੀ ਦਾ

ਨੁ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥

Pāp kī jaṅ lai kāblahu dhāi=ā jorī mangai
dān ve lālo. ॥

ਸਰਮੁ ਧਰਮੁ ਦੁਇ ਛਪਿ ਖਲੇਏ ਕੂੜੁ ਫਿਰੈ ਪਰਯਾ

ਨੁ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥

Saram dharam du=e chhap khalo=e kūṛ
firai pardhān ve lālo.

ਕਾਜੀਆ ਬਾਮਣਾ ਕੀ ਗਲ ਥਕੀ ਅਗਦੁ ਪੜੈ ਸੈਤਾ

ਨੁ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥

Kājī=ā bāmṇā kī gal thakī agadṭ parai
saiṭān ve lālo.

ਮੁਸਲਮਾਨੀਆ ਪੜਹਿ ਕਤੇਬਾ ਕਸਟ ਮਹਿ ਕਰਹਿ

ਖੁਦਾਇ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥

Musalmānī=ā parēh kaṭebā kasat meh
karahi khudā=e ve lālo.

ਜਾਤਿ ਸਨਾਤੀ ਹੋਰਿ ਹਿਦਵਾਈਆ ਏਹਿ ਭੀ ਲੇਖੈ

ਲਾਇ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥

Jāt sanātī hor hidvāī=ā ehi bhī lekḥai lā=e
ve lālo.

ਖੂਨ ਕੇ ਸੋਹਿਲੇ ਗਾਵੀਅਹਿ ਨਾਨਕ ਰਤੁ ਕਾ ਕੁੰਗੁ

ਪਾਇ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥੧॥

Khūn ke sohile gavī=ah Nānak raṭ kā
kungū pā=e ve lālo. ||1||

ਸਾਹਿਬ ਕੇ ਗੁਣ ਨਾਨਕੁ ਗਾਵੈ ਮਾਸ ਪੁਰੀ ਵਿਚਿ ਆ

ਖੁ ਮਸੋਲਾ ॥

Sāhib ke guṇ Nānak gāvai mās purī vich
ākḥ masolā.

ਜਿਨਿ ਉਪਾਈ ਰੰਗਿ ਰਵਾਈ

ਬੈਠਾ ਵੇਖੈ ਵਖਿ ਇਕੇਲਾ ॥

Jin upāṁ rang ravāṁ baiṭhā vekḥai vakḥ ikelā.

ਸਚਾ ਸੇ ਸਾਹਿਬੁ ਸਚੁ ਤਪਾਵਸੁ ਸਚੜਾ ਨਿਆਉ ਕ ਰੇਗੁ ਮਸੇਲਾ ॥

Sachā so sāhib sachṭapāvas sachṛā niāṁo kareg masolā.

ਕਾਇਆ ਕਪੜੁ ਟੁਰੁ ਟੁਰੁ ਹੇਸੀ ਹਿੰਦੁਸਤਾਨੁ ਸਮਾ ਲਸੀ ਬੇਲਾ ॥

Kāiā kaparṭuk tuk hosī hindusatān samālsī bolā.

ਆਵਨਿ ਅਠਤਰੈ ਜਾਨਿ ਸਤਾਨਵੈ ਹੇਰੁ ਭੀ ਉਠਸੀ

ਮਰਦ ਕਾ ਚੇਲਾ ॥

Āvan aṭṭarai jān satānvai hor bhī uṭḥsī marad kā chelā.

ਸਚ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਨਾਨਕੁ ਆਖੈ ਸਚੁ ਸੁਣਾਇਸੀ ਸਚ

ਕੀ ਬੇਲਾ ॥੨॥੩॥੫॥

Sachṭkī baṇī Nānak ākḥai sachṭsuṇāiṁsī sachṭkī belā. ||2||3||5||

ਅਗਗਸ, ਮ: 1, ਪੰਨਾ 722-723.

The translation of the above verse by Manmohan Singh [42], SGPC, has been reproduced here since it is accepted by most Sikh theologians.

Bringing the marriage party of sin, Babar has hastened from Kabul and demands perforce the gift of our Land, etc. O Lalo. Modesty and righteousness both have vanished, and falsehood moves about as the leader, O Lalo. The function of the Qazis and the Brahmans is over and the Satan now reads the marriage rites. The Muslim women read the Quran and in suffering call upon God, O Lalo (beloved ones).

The Hindu women of high caste and others of low caste may also be put in the same account, O Lalo.

Nanak, the eulogies of murder are sung, and the saffron of blood is sprinkled, O Lalo (beloved ones). 1.

Nanak sings the glories of the Lord in the city of corpses and mentions this affair. He, who has made the mortals and attached them to pleasures, sits apart and alone, and beholds them. He, the Lord is true, true is His decision, and He issues command based on true

justice.

The body cloth shall be torn into pieces and shreds. The(n) shall Hindustan remember my word. Coming in seventy eight (Vikrami), they (the Mughals) shall depart in ninety seven and then another disciple of brave Man shall arise.

Nanak utters the word of truth and proclaims truth at the right time. 2, 3, 5. AGGS, M 1, p 722-23.

A critical analysis of the above verse clearly indicates that it is an eyewitness of destruction of Aminabad (Saidpur) by Babar. Prof. Sahib Singh under the following verse of Guru Nanak:

ਖੁਰਾਸਾਨ¹ ਖਸਮਾਨਾ² ਕੀਆ ਹਿੰਦੁਸਤਾਨੁ³

ਡਰਾਇਆ⁴ ॥ khuraasaan khasmaanaa kee-aa hindusatān daraa-i-aa.

AGGS, M 1, p 360. *After handing over the control² of Khuraasaan¹ to somebody, Babar terrified⁴ Hindustan³ (India), adds a note:*

ਨੋਟ: ਜਦੋਂ ਮੱਕੇ ਵਲ ਦੀ ਤੀਜੀ 'ਉਦਾਸੀ' ਤੋਂ ਗੁਰੂ

ਨਾਨਕ ਦੇਵ ਜੀ ਬਗ਼ਦਾਦ ਕਾਬਲ ਦੇ ਰਸਤੇ ਸੰਨ 1521 ਵਿਚ ਹਿੰਦੁਸਤਾਨ ਨੂੰ ਵਾਪਸ ਆ ਰਹੇ ਸਨ,

ਉਹਨੀਂ ਹੀ ਦਿਨੀਂ ਬਾਬਰ ਨੇ ਭੇਰਾ ਸਿਆਲਕੋਟ

ਮਾਰ ਕੇ ਸੈਦਪੁਰ (ਐਮਨਾਬਾਦ) ਤੇ ਹਮਲਾ ਕੀਤਾ

ਸੀ। ਸਤਿਗੁਰੂ ਜੀ ਭੀ ਐਮਨਾਬਾਦ ਪਹੁੰਚ ਚੁਕੇ

ਸਨ। ਬਾਬਰ ਦੇ ਮੁਗ਼ਲ ਫੌਜੀਆਂ ਹੱਥੋਂ ਜੇ

ਦੁਰਗਤਿ ਸੈਦਪੁਰ-ਨਿਵਾਸੀਆਂ ਦੀ ਅੱਖੀਂ ਵੇਖੀ,

ਉਸ ਦਾ ਜ਼ਿਕਰ ਸਤਿਗੁਰੂ ਜੀ ਇਸ ਸ਼ਬਦ ਵਿਚ

ਕਰ ਰਹੇ ਹਨ।

English: During the days Guru Nanak was coming back in 1521 CE to India from Baghdad and Kabul, his third travel from Mecca, Babar attacked Saidpur (Aminabad) after conquering Sialkot. Satguru (Nanak) had also reached at Aminabad at that time. Satguru (Nanak) is explaining, as **eyewitness**, the destruction of the habitants of Saidpur by the army of Babar.

At page 360 of the AGGS Prof Sahib Singh says it is an “**eyewitness**”, but at page 722 he says it is revealed by Kasam (God).”

This is a double standard of our prestigious Sikh theologian, Prof Sahib Singh.

The last phrase of the verse at page 723 is as follows:

ਸਚ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਨਾਨਕੁ ਆਖੈ ਸਚੁ ਸੁਣਾਇਸੀ ਸਚ ਕੀ ਬੇਲਾ ॥੨॥੩॥੫॥

Sachṭkī baṇī Nānak ākḥai sachṭsuṇāiṁsī sachṭkī belā. ||2||3||5||

ਅਗਗਸ, ਮ: 1, ਪੰਨਾ 723.

Guru Nanak says the truth and speaks the truth at the right time when the truth is to be spoken.

Guru Nanak is not afraid to speak the truth.

Let us also speak the truth: is the above verse of Guru Nanak a Dhur ki Bani (revealed words) or an eyewitness of Guru Nanak?

There is another phrase of Guru Nanak in support of revealed bani, which is invariably translated by many as follows:

ਤਾ ਮੈ ਕਹਿਆ ਕਰਣੁ ਜਾ ਤੁਝੈ ਕਹਾਇਆ ॥

Fā mai kahiā kahaṇ jā ṭujḥai kahāiā.

When I have spoken, I spoke as You (God) made me speak.

However, this phrase can be interpreted the same way as that ਜੈਸੀ ਮੈ ਆਵੈ ਖਸਮ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਤੈਸੜਾ ਕਰੀ ਗਿਆ ਨੁ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥ (Jaisī mai āvai kḥsam kī baṇī ṭaisrā karī gīān ve lālo.), was interpreted, keeping in view that here God is not involved but the brain. It is the brain which coins the sabd with the use of patience, knowledge and wisdom as explained in JAP Stanza # 38. Therefore, it is interpreted as follows:

ਤਾ ਮੈ ਕਹਿਆ ਕਰਣੁ ਜਾ ਤੁਝੈ ਕਹਾਇਆ ॥

Fā mai kahiā kahaṇ jā ṭujḥai kahāiā.

I speak what I have evaluated in my brain.

AGGS, M 1, p 566.

To support the above thesis, that the Eternal Entity (God) does not reveal words to any prophets of any religion, further discussion is needed as follows:

GURU NANAK'S CONCEPT OF THE ETERNAL ENTITY (GOD)


Guru Nanak designed a unique logo, **ੴ**, to represent his concept of the Eternal Entity (commonly called God in English and by many other names in other religions and languages). However, the **ੴ** has not been only misunderstood but has been interpolated, misinterpreted and misrepresented by many Sikh theologians, scholars, and researchers for a long time. Now **ੴ** is widely accepted as **ਏਕੁ ਓਅੰਕਾਰੁ** (Ek Oankaar) or **ਏਕੁ ਓਮਕਾਰੁ** (Ek Aumkaar) by Sikhs at large. Chahal has discussed that **ੴ** has nothing to do with **ਏਕੁ ਓਅੰਕਾਰੁ** (Ek Oankaar) or **ਏਕੁ ਓਮਕਾਰੁ** (Ek Aumkaar) [18, 21-24]. Now some more documents have been used to re-affirm his previous findings that **ੴ** stands for **ਏਕੁ ਓਹ ਬੇਅੰਤੁ** (Ek Oh Beant' - One and Only, That is Infinite). The **ੴ** also represents the logo of SIKHI (Sikhism) founded by Guru Nanak.

Bhai Gurdas (trained at Banaras) was the first to interpolate, misinterpret and misrepresent **ੴ** as "Ek Oakaar" connecting it with Vedic and Vedanta philosophies. In Upanishad, "Oankaar" represents OM which means Trinity of God: Brahma, Vishnu and Shiva. Guru Nanak does not accept the Eternal Entity (God) in Trinity. [25] Later on, Nirmalas (also trained at Banaras) explained **ੴ** as "Ek Oankaar" deeply rooted in Vedic and Vedanta philosophies in the Faridkot Vala Teeka. [17] Then Professor Sahib Singh confirmed **ੴ** as "Ek Oankaar". [17] Thereafter, all the Sikh scholars and the Sikhs at large accepted **ੴ** as "Ek Oankaar". During the celebration of 500th Birthday of Guru Nanak, a seminar was held at Guru Nanak Dev University at Amritsar in which **ੴ** was reconfirmed as "Ek Oankaar". [25]

Recently Dr Harbhajan Singh has written a booklet, **ੴ ਸਰੂਪ ਅਤੇ ਦਰਸਨ:**

ਪੁਨਹ ਅਵਲੋਕਨ | **ੴ** Sarup Atai Drashan: Punah Avlokan). This booklet was circulated by Dr Hardev Singh Virk to various Sikh scholars, including me, to point out that Dr Harbhajan Singh has criticized Dr Devinder Singh Chahal's explanation of **ੴ** as Ek Oh (actually it is Ek Oh Beant). He used un-academic language to criticize the work of Chahal. Moreover, he used Sanskritized Punjabi which was more difficult to read and understand than that simple Punjabi used about 750 and 550 years ago by Baba Farid and Guru Nanak. He reconfirmed that **ੴ** is Ek Oankaar, declaring so as if Chahal had not read the var of Bhai Gurdas where he declared that Open Oora (**ੳ**) in **ੴ** was "Oankaar". Dr Harbhajan Singh did not care to read my paper seriously where I had mentioned clearly that Bhai Gurdas (trained at Banaras) was the first to interpolate, misinterpret, and misrepresent **ੴ** as "Ek Oakaar" connecting it with Vedic and Vedanta philosophies. Now, during the celebration of the 550th Birthday, Dr Harbhajan Singh reconfirmed in his above booklet that **ੴ** as "Ek Oakaar" is deeply rooted in Vedic and Vedanta Philosophies.

I wonder if the Sikh intelligentsia has not been able to understand the concept of God represented as a logo, **ੴ**, designed by Guru Nanak even at the time of his 550th Birthday, when will they escape the influence of Vedic and Vedanta philosophies?

I have described this logo, **ੴ**, many times for over 20 years, but nobody has tried to understand it. However, there are some who have already accept **ੴ** as 'EK OH' but miss the importance of the extended end () of **ੳ** (Open Oora) as **ਬੇਅੰਤ** (beant - Infinite).

Chahal's latest explanation of this logo, **ੴ**, is given in detail in the e-book, JAP:


The Essence of Nanakian Philosophy, in Chapter III. [25] It is also briefly explained as **ਨਿਗੁਣ** (*nirgun* as 'Nothingness'/ 'Singularity') and **ਸਰਗੁਣ** (*sargun* - Universe) stated as follows [26, 27]:

The logo, **ੴ**, has been dissembled for explanation as follows:

$$\text{ੴ} = ੧ + ੳ + \text{ੴ}$$

'੧' (Ek - One) represents Oneness (Singularity) - the **ਨਿਗੁਣ** (*nirgun*) state of the Eternal Entity (God).

'ੳ' (open oora) represents 'ੳਹ' (Oh - That) for ੧ (One) since there is no descriptive/specific name for the ੧ (One).

 (Extended end of the open oora - 'ੳ') represents infinity (**ਬੇਅੰਤ** - beant) for **ੳ** (That), i.e. for ੧ (One).

Therefore, **ੴ** is One and Only (Singularity) that is Infinite.

If it is so, then we can infer that the '੧' (Ek - One) in **ੴ**, is That (**ੳਹ** - Oh), where matter/Energy - space/time is in an infinitely small unit (Singularity), which looks like Nothingness, **ਸੁੰਨੁ** (*Sunn*), but sprang into the Universe after the Big Bang. The above analysis clearly indicates that the logo **ੴ** designed by Guru Nanak, can be pronounced as **ਇਕੁ ਓ ਬੇਅੰਤ** (*Ek Oh Beant'*) in Punjabi. It can be pronounced as 'The One and Only That is Infinite' in English. This is based on the following explanation by Guru Nanak:

੧ (One) in **ੴ** :

The one in this logo represents the 'One and Only' according to Guru Nanak:

ਸਾਹਿਬੁ ਮੇਰਾ ਏਕੈ ਹੈ ॥ ਏਕੈ ਹੈ ਭਾਈ ਏਕੈ ਹੈ ॥੧॥ ਰਹਾਉ ॥

Sāhib merā eko hai. Éko hai bhā̃o eko hai.
||1|| rahā̃o.

*My Eternal Entity¹ is One and Only^{2,3,4},
Hey brother!*

AGGS, M 1, p 350.

ਏਕ¹ ਮਹਿ ਸਰਬ² ਸਰਬ² ਮਹਿ ਏਕ³ ਏਹ ਸਤਿ⁴
ਗੁਰਿ⁵ ਦੇਖਿ⁶ ਦਿਖਾਈ⁷ ॥੫॥

Ēk mēh sarab sarab mēh ekā eh satgur
dekḥ dikhā̃o. ||5||

*The True⁴ Enlightener⁵ has given⁷ (me)
the vision⁶ that the One¹ is in everything²
and everything² is in that One³.*

AGGS, M 1, p 907.

ੳ (Open oora) in ੳੳ: According to Mahan Kosh of Bhai Kahn Singh [28], the letter ੳ (open oora) means ੳਹ (Oh - That):

ਨਾ ੳਹੁ ਮਰੈ ਨ ਹੋਵੈ ਸੋਗੁ ॥

Nā oh marai na hovai sog

*Oh (That - One) does not die; thus there is
no reason to mourn.*

AGGS, M 1, p 9.

Note: Here ੳ (ੳਹੁ - Oh) stands for 'One' since Guru Nanak does not like to use any descriptive or specific names for God.

(∞) The extended End of Open Oora (ੳ) in ੳੳ represents the infinity of the One (Eternal Entity):

ਗੁਰਮੁਖਿ¹ ਬੇਅੰਤੁ² ਧਿਆਈ³

ਅੰਤੁ⁴ ਨ ਪਾਰਾਵਾ⁵ ॥੪੬॥

Gurmukḥ beant̃ dḥiā̃o ai
ant̃ na pā̃vār. ||46||

*The Guru-oriented¹ contemplates³ the
Infinite², Who has no limit⁴ or end⁵.*

AGGS, M 1, p 936.

ਤਾ¹ ਕੇ ਅੰਤੁ² ਨ ਪਾਏ³ ਜਾਹਿ ॥ ਏਹੁ ਅੰਤੁ⁴ ਨ
ਜਾਣੈ⁵ ਕੋਇ⁶ ॥

Fā ke ant̃ na pā̃e jāhi. Éhu ant̃ na jānai
kõe.

*The infiniteness² of that One¹ cannot be
comprehended³.*

(In fact) Nobody⁶ knows⁵ Its infiniteness⁴.

AGGS, Jap 24, p 5.

If we examine the above phrases, it becomes clear that in Nanakian Philosophy, the Eternal Entity (God) has been addressed as ੳੳ, which represents the modern concept of the '1' (Ek – One) in ੳੳ as 'Singularity' or as ਸੁੰਨੁ (Sunn) or ਨਿਗੁਣ (nirgun as 'Nothingness') which sprang into the Universe or ਸਰਗੁਣ (sargun) state. However, this nirgun state and sargun state are quite different than those that are understood in Vedic and Vedanta philosophies.

SABD: THE GURU OF NANAK

Two words, 'sabd' and 'guru' and their combination as 'sabd guru' have been extensively used in the Aad Guru Granth Sahib (AGGS). It is usually understood that the word 'sabd' is derived from Sanskrit and is spelled as 'sabda' in English, however, in this paper it will be spelled as 'sabd' as spelled in the AGGS. In Hinduism, every person or spiritual leader must have a Guru. For example, in the Bhagavad Gita, Arjun, a Kshatriya prince, accepted Krishna as his Guru on the battlefield. The Siddhas had Gurakh Nath as their Guru and Bhagat Kabir had Ramanand as his Guru. Many Hindu families have their own personal Gurus. In the same sense, the Siddhas wanted to know the Guru of Nanak during a discourse between Nanak and Siddhas. Nanak replied that his 'guru' is 'sabd' (sabda). Chahal [29] has discussed the intrinsic meanings of 'guru' and 'sabd' (sabda) in detail as follows:

During discussion between Guru Nanak and Siddhas (Siddh Gost), the Siddhas questioned Guru Nanak:

Who is your Guru?

ਕਵਣ ਮੂਲੁ¹ ਕਵਣ ਮਤਿ² ਵੇਲਾ³ ॥

ਤੇਰਾ ਕਵਣੁ ਗੁਰੂ ਜਿਸ ਕਾ ਤੂ ਚੇਲਾ ॥

Kavaṇ mūl kavaṇ maṭ velā.

Ferā kavaṇ gurū jis kā tū chelā.

AGGS, M 1, p 943. [5]

*What is the source of beginning¹ and
which type of philosophy² is of this
Age³?*

Who is that 'guru' of whom you are his disciple?

Guru Nanak answers about his 'guru' as follows:

ਪਵਨ¹ ਅਰੰਤੁ² ਸਤਿ³ ਗੁਰ⁴ ਮਤਿ⁵ ਵੇਲਾ⁶ ॥

ਸਬਦੁ⁷ ਗੁਰੂ⁸ ਸੁਰਤਿ⁹ ਧੁਨਿ¹⁰ ਚੇਲਾ¹¹ ॥

Pavan arambḥ satgur maṭ velā.

Sabaḍ gurū suraṭ dḥun chelā.

*The air¹ is the beginning² of every life and
this is the Age⁶ of Enlightenment⁵
through the True³ Guru⁴.*

Who is the true guru?

It is explained in the second sentence:

*The sabd⁷ is the guru⁸ (enlightener) and
my keen¹⁰ conscience⁹ is its disciple¹¹.*

Now the question is:

Which 'Sabd' is the 'Guru' of Nanak?

That 'sabd' has been described by Guru Nanak himself in stanza #38 of JAP Bani as follows:

ਜਤੁ¹ ਪਾਹਾਰ² ਧੀਰਜੁ³ ਸੁਨਿਆਰੁ⁴ ॥

ਅਹਰਣਿ⁵ ਮਤਿ⁶ ਵੇਦੁ⁷ ਹਥੀਆਰੁ⁸ ॥

Jaṭ pāhārā dḥīraj suniār.

Ahraṇ maṭ veḍ hathiār.

*Self-control¹ should be the furnace², and
patience³ of the goldsmith⁴.*

*Wisdom⁶ should be the anvil⁵ and
knowledge⁷ should be the tools⁸.*

ਭਉ⁹ ਖਲਾ¹⁰ ਅਗਨਿ¹¹ ਤਪ ਤਾਉ ॥

ਭਾਂਡਾ¹² ਭਾਉ¹³ ਅੰਮ੍ਰਿਤੁ¹⁴ ਤਿਤੁ¹⁵ ਢਾਲਿ¹⁶ ॥

ਘੜੀ¹⁷ ਸਬਦੁ¹⁸ ਸਚੀ ਟਕਸਾਲ¹⁹ ॥

Bḥão kḥalā agan ṭap ṭā̃o.

Bḥā̃ndā bhā̃o amrit̃ ṭiṭ dḥāl.

Gḥarī̃ai sabaḍ sacḥiṭ taksāl.

*Love⁹ for the Eternal Entity (God) should
be the bellows¹⁰ to blow air into fire¹¹ to
make it super-hot.*

*The body (mind), full of love¹³, is the
melting pot¹² where the above-mentioned
self-control, patience, wisdom and
knowledge as matter¹⁵ to be melted¹⁶*

*together to coin¹⁷ the sabd (idea/
philosophy)¹⁸ as an Amrit (elixir)¹⁴ in the
mint¹⁹ of truth.*

ਜਿਨ ਕਉ ਨਦਰਿ²⁰ ਕਰਮੁ²¹ ਤਿਨ ਕਾਰ²² ॥

ਨਾਨਕ ਨਦਰੀ²³ ਨਦਰਿ²⁴ ਨਿਹਾਲ²⁵ ॥੩੮॥

Jin kão naḍar karam ṭin kār.

Nānak naḍrī naḍar nihāl. ||38||

*Such type of work²² to coin sabd (idea/
philosophy) can only be done by those*

who have the capability²¹ of vision²⁰. That Eternal Entity (God) is happy²⁵ for such people who have this type of vision^{23, 24}. 38. AGGS, Jap # 38, p 8.

This stanza # 38 of JAP bani clearly indicates that the word, 'sabd', means the 'idea' or 'philosophy', which has been realized by the use of patience, knowledge and wisdom. This 'sabd' enlightens a person to discover the right path of life. Therefore, 'sabd' is interpreted as 'enlightening idea/philosophy'.

Guru Nanak further explains humans inherit four characteristics: seeing, hearing, sensation, and thinking/analysing the data collected. I would interpret the following stanza by keeping in view the involvement of various sciences - biology, neurosciences, physiology, physics, chemistry, etc.:

ਚਾਰਿ ਪਦਾਰਥ ਲੈ ਜਗਿ ਆਇਆ ॥

ਸਿਵ ਸਕਤੀ ਘਰਿ ਵਾਸਾ ਪਾਇਆ ॥

ਏਕੁ ਵਿਸਾਰੈ ਤਾ ਪਿੜਾ ਹਾਰੈ ਅੰਧੁਲੈ ਨਾਮੁ³

ਵਿਸਾਰਾ ਹੇ ॥੬॥

Chār padārath lai jag āiā.

Siv saktī ghar vāsā pāiā.

Ēk visārē tā piṛ hāre andhulai nām visārā he. ||6||

AGGS, M 1, p 1027.

Man was born⁴ into this world³ with four¹ characteristics²:

(Seeing, hearing, sensation and thinking/capability to analyse the data collected.)

In fact, all these characteristics of humans⁶ are based⁷ on Universal Energy⁵.

If one forgets⁹ about these four characteristics⁸, then that innocent (human)¹² loses¹¹ all his study/capability¹⁰ and also forgets¹⁴ to use the Laws of Nature¹³ for the betterment of one's life.

In the above stanza, Guru Nanak explains how a sabd (idea/philosophy) is coined (formulated) as the Amrit (life-giving elixir) or way of living, which will mould a person to be highly moral and progressive. Guru Amardas explained the Amrit (idea/philosophy) is already present in the body (mind), but one has

to be awakened to that Amrit (in AGGS at page 644). However, Guru Nanak continues to explain further that body and mind have the four faculties: seeing, hearing, sensation, and thinking/capability to analyse the data collected. In spite of the above teachings of Guru Nanak, the Sikhs continue to follow Eastern philosophy that a personal human guru is necessary to guide a person to achieve a moral life, to meet God, and to achieve mukati (salvation). That is why many sants/babas have appeared in Punjab who are brainwashing their followers to be dependent upon their advice rather than to use their own intellect to coin the sabd taught by Guru Nanak. Of course, some people may need a guru (teacher) to teach those qualities to coin the 'sabd' and to develop the four qualities discussed earlier to resolve their problems, and to cross the so-called dreadful sea of life.

During the discourse (Siddh Gost), the Siddhas continued questioning Guru Nanak:

What is your philosophy?

ਕਵਣ ਕਥਾ ਲੇ ਰਹਹੁ ਨਿਰਾਲੇ ॥

ਬੋਲੈ ਨਾਨਕੁ ਸੁਣਹੁ ਤੁਮ ਬਾਲੇ ॥

Kavaṇ kathā le rahhu nirāle.

Bolai Nānak suṇhu tum bāle.

Question 42 b:

What type of unique⁵ philosophy⁴ do you have?

Speak out, O child⁶ Nanak, we are ready to listen to you.

And

What is the sabd, which can help us cross the dreadful sea of life?

ਏਸੁ ਕਥਾ ਕਾ ਦੇਇ ਬੀਚਾਰੁ ॥

ਭਵਜਲੁ ਸਬਦਿ ਲੰਘਾਵਣਹਾਰੁ ॥੪੩॥

Ēs kathā kā de-e biḥār.

Bhavjal sabaḍ langhāvāṇhār. ||43||

Question 42c:

Could you, please, deliberate⁸ on your unique philosophy⁷?

What is that Sabd¹⁰ (your idea/philosophy) which could help¹¹ us to cross the dreadful⁹ sea of life?

Guru Nanak answers as follows:

ਸੁਰਤਿ ਸਬਦਿ ਭਵੈ ਸਾਗਰੁ ਤਰੀਐ ਨਾਨਕ ਨਾਮੁ ਵਖਾਣੈ ॥

Surat sabaḍ bhav sāgar tarī-ai Nānak nām vakhāṇe.

Nanak explains⁷ that understanding the Laws of Nature⁶ and turning one's conscience¹ towards such Sabd² (as described in JAP Stanza # 38 above) will help to cross⁵ the dreadful³ sea of life⁴.

AGGS, M 1, p 938.

Guru Nanak continues to explain that the 'sabd', as explained in Stanza # 38 of JAP bani, is the answer to various problems of life:

ਗਿਆਨੁ ਵਿਦੁਣੀ ਭਵੈ ਸਬਾਈ ॥

ਸਾਚਾ ਰਵਿ ਰਹਿਆ ਲਿਵ ਲਾਈ ॥

ਨਿਰਭਉ ਸਬਦੁ ਗੁਰੂ ॥

ਸਚੁ ਜਾਤਾ ਜੋਤੀ ਜੋਤਿ ਮਿਲਾਇਦਾ ॥੮॥

Giān vihūṇī bhavaī sabā-ī.

Sāchā rav rahi-ā liv lā-ī.

Nirbhā-o sabaḍ gurū sach jāṭā joṭī joṭī milā-īdā. ||8||

A person, without² using intellect¹, is wandering³ all around⁴ to understand the Eternal Entity (God).

That person could not understand that the Eternal Entity⁵ is prevailing⁶ everywhere as if imbibed⁷ in everything.

A person, who is not afraid⁸ of anybody/anything, can understand¹² the Eternal Entity (God)¹¹ through the enlightening¹⁰ philosophy⁹ (sabd⁹ guru¹⁰).

AGGS, M 1, p 1034.

Many of the writers translate 'sabd' as 'sabd' and 'guru' as 'guru'. But nobody tries to explain the meaning of 'guru' and of 'sabd' as explained above.

Guru Nanak further explains that the 'sabd' is the real 'guru' in life:

ਘਘੈ ਘਾਲ ਸੇਵਰੁ ਜੇ ਘਾਲੈ ਸਬਦਿ ਗੁਰੂ ਕੇ ਲਾਗਿ ਰਹੈ ॥

ਬੁਰਾ ਭਲਾ ਜੇ ਸਮ ਕਰਿ ਜਾਣੈ ਇਨ ਬਿਧਿ ॥

ਸਾਹਿਬੁ ਰਮਤੁ ਰਹੈ ॥੮॥

Ghaghāi ghāl sevkar je ghālai sabaḍ gurū kai lāg rahi.

Burā bhālā je sam kar jāṇai in biḍh sāhib

ramaṭ rahai. ||8||
If a dedicated¹ devotee² remains devoted^{3,6} to the concept of enlightening⁵ sabd⁴ and considers¹⁰ bad⁷ and good days equally⁹ as a part of life, that person understands the Eternal Entity¹² through this method¹¹ and remains attached¹³ to the Eternal Entity.
 AGGS, M 1, p 432.

Guru Nanak continues to advise the use of 'sabd' in life:

ਅਮਲੁ ਕਰਿ ਧਰਤੀ ਬੀਜੁ ਸਬਦੈ ਕਰਿ ਸਚੁ

ਕੀ ਆਬ ਨਿਤ ਦੇਹਿ ਪਾਈ ॥

ਰੇਇ ਕਿਰਸਾਣੁ ਈਮਾਨੁ ਜੰਮਾਇ ਲੈ ਭਿਸਤੁ

ਦੇਜਕੁ ਮੂੜੈ ਏਵ ਜਾਈ ॥੧॥

Amal kar dḥartī bij sabdo kar sach kī āb niṭ dēh pāī.

Ho=e kirsāṇ īmān jammā=e lai bh̄isat ḡojak mūre ev jāī. ||1||

Make good deed¹ as the soil² to sow the seed³ of the sabd⁴ (idea/philosophy realized) and always⁷ water that seed with the water⁸ of habit⁶ of speaking truth⁵.

Be such a type of farmer.

If one accepts¹⁰ to be such type of farmer⁹, then it will become¹¹ clear to that ignorant/innocent one¹⁴, what does heaven¹² and hell¹³ mean.

AGGS, M 1, p 24. (Note 4)

Guru Arjun has also used 'sabd guru' in the same sense as used by Guru Nanak but involves God (Hari) as follows:

ਹਰਿ ਹਮਰਾ ਹਮ ਹਰਿ ਕੇ ਦਾਸੇ ਨਾਨਕ ਸਬਦੁ ਗੁ

ਰੂ ਸਦੁ ਦੀਨਾ ਜੀਉ ॥੪॥੧੪॥੨੧॥

Har hamrā ham har ke dāse Nānak sabaḡ gurū sach dīnā jīo. ||4||14||21||

Guru Arjun as Nanak claims that Hari (God) belongs to him and he is the servant of that Hari (God). This has happened through the sabd as the guru.

AGGS, M 5, p 100.

Finally, Guru Nanak sums up that 'sabd', as explained in Stanza 38 of JAP Bani, helps one to become an enlightened person:

ਏਕੁ ਸਬਦੁ ਜਿਤੁ ਕਥਾ ਵੀਚਾਰੀ ॥

ਗੁਰਮੁਖਿ ਹਉਮੈ ਅਗਨਿ ਨਿਵਾਰੀ ॥੪੪॥

Ēk sabaḡ jīṭ kathā vīchārī.

Gurmukḥ ha=umai agan nivārī. ||44||

The one, who deliberates^{3,4} on that one¹ sabd² (Enlightening Idea/philosophy), can eliminate⁸ fire-like⁷ ego⁶, to become an enlightened person⁵.

AGGS, M 1, p 943.

IS MEANING OF "SABD" AS "GURU" BEING LOST?

This is a lengthy discussion and interested readers can look into the article: Sabd – The Guru of Nanak. [29]

CONCLUSIONS

Although Sikhi (Sikhism) is claimed by the Sikhs as a modern religion in the world, it is continuously being interpolated, misinterpreted and misrepresented under the influence of Vedas, Vedanta and ancient philosophy. Guru Nanak is usually described as a mystic, who had a spiritual experience at the age of 27, 30, or 38 when he came out of the Vein rivulet after being missing for three days. He was in the court of God when he attained revelation (Dhur ki Bani).

This concept, based on illogical and unscientific stories, is widely accepted in the Sikh world, as reported recently by Lal and Michaud, Lal and Attrey, Dawe, SGPC, Amritsar, Udham Singh, etc.

Prof John Bowker has mentioned that it is necessary for their Prophets or their Guru to claim that they have revelation from God in one form or another in almost all religions.

The concept of revelation to Guru Nanak is based on Guru Arjun's most quoted phrase: **ਯੁਰ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਆਈ ॥**

(Dḥur kī baṇī āī.).

Some writers support this claim by quoting the following bani of Guru Nanak: **ਹਉ ਢਾਢੀ ਵੇਕਾਰੁ ਕਾਰੈ ਲਾਇਆ ॥** (Ha=o dhāḡhī vekār kārāi lāī=ā.).

Guru Nanak himself has questioned where the court of God could be in this Universe. According to him, God does

not dwell in any particular place but is everywhere.

The other quote is,

ਜੈਸੀ ਮੈ ਆਵੈ ਖਸਮ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਤੈਸੜਾ ਕਰੀ ਗਿਆ

ਨੁ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥ (Jaisī mai āvai kḥasam kī baṇī

ṭaisrā karī gi=ān ve lālo.) This phrase is followed by a sabd which explains the destruction of Saidpur (Aminabad) by Babar **as an eyewitness**. Therefore, it could not be revelation by God.

Karminder Singh and Chahal et al have refuted this illogical and unscientific story about the revelation to Guru Nanak.

It is recommended that the sabd, **ਹਉ**

ਢਾਢੀ ਵੇਕਾਰੁ ਕਾਰੈ ਲਾਇਆ ॥ (Ha=o dhāḡhī

vekār kārāi lāī=ā.) needs critical analysis by the Sikh intelligentsia to discover the truth about it and the truth in it.

It has been discussed in detail that the phrase, **ਜੈਸੀ ਮੈ ਆਵੈ ਖਸਮ ਕੀ ਬਾਣੀ ਤੈਸੜਾ**

ਕਰੀ ਗਿਆਨੁ ਵੇ ਲਾਲੇ ॥ (Jaisī mai āvai

kḥasam kī baṇī ṭaisrā karī gi=ān ve lālo.) does not support that God revealed the word to Guru Nanak.

However, Guru Nanak himself admits that his 'guru is sabd' when the Siddhas asked about his guru: **ਸਬਦੁ ਗੁਰੂ ਸੁਰਤਿ**

ਯੁਨਿ¹⁰ ਚੇਲਾ¹¹ ॥ (Pavan arambḥ satgur maṭ velā.)

Guru Nanak himself has described that 'sabd' in JAP bani stanza # 38.

The Eternal Entity (God) described by Guru Nanak cannot reveal word (bani) to either Guru Nanak or any other prophet.

Finally, It is concluded that:

Guru Nanak himself does not admit anywhere that bani (Word) was revealed to him by God in any form and in any way of communication. Guru Nanak has described the Eternal Entity (so-called God) quite different than that of the concepts of God in other religions. Guru Nanak represent the Eternal Entity in the form of a logo, **ੴ**. This logo (**ੴ**), has been described in details by Chahal in JAP: The Essence of Nanakian Philosophy.

[25] Guru Nanak promulgated his philosophy by his keen observations about the cosmos, environment, nature, and behaviour of animals and humans plus having dialogues/discussions with the various heads of the religious leaders. At the top of it is his GURU: THE SABD, as described in Stanza # 38 of JAP bani, but not through revelation.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am grateful to Dr Kulbir Singh Thind for permitting me to use Gurbani in Unicode and its transliteration in Roman alphabet from his Web site, www.srigranth.org. I am also thankful to Miss Komal Sidhu, Speech Therapist, for editing the manuscript again and again.

REFERENCES

1. (2019) Kartarpur corridor access mode undecided: Centre - Matter to be discussed with Pakistan, says Puri The Tribune (Chandigarh). <https://www.tribuneindia.com/news/punjab/kartarpur-corridor-access-mode-undecided-centre/715830.html>
2. Criticism of Sikhism Wikipedia. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Criticism_of_Sikhism
3. SINGH, B. (1883) Faridkot Wala Teeka. https://searchgurbani.com/faridkot_wala_teeka
4. CHAHAL, D. S., THIND, K. S, DHAILWAL, A. S. AND SCHELL, J (2015) Nanak: The Guru - The Founder of Sikhism (Laval, Quebec, Canada, Institute for Understanding Sikhism). http://www.iuscanada.com/books/2015/ebook_Nanak_The%20Guru_The_Founder_of_Sikhism.pdf
5. AGGS (1983) Aad Guru Granth Sahib (Amritsar, Punjab, India, Shiromani Gurdwara Parbandhak Committee). (M = Mahla, i.e., succession number of the Sikh Gurus to the House of Nanak, M is replaced with the name of Bhagat/ Bhatt for their Bani, p = Page of the AGGS).
6. LAL, H., MICHAUD, EK ONKAAR KAUR KHALSA (2018) IS GURU NANAK'S PARKASH DAY DIFFERENT FROM GURU NANAK'S BIRTH DAY? YES, IT IS, The Sikh Bulletin (11 and 12), p 22.
7. SINGH, K. (2018) IS GURU NANAK'S PARKASH DAY DIFFERENT FROM GURU NANAK'S BIRTH DAY? NO, IT ISN'T, The Sikh Bulletin, 20 (11-12), p 27.
8. LAL, H., MICHAUD, EK ONG KAAR KHALSA (2018) Is Guru Nanak's Parkash Day Different from Guru Nanak's Birth Day? Yes, It Is. <https://seekingwisdomblog.wordpress.com/2018/11/20/is-guru-nanaks-parkash-day-different-from-guru-nanaks-birth-day-yes-it-is/>
9. GURDAS, B. Bhai Gurdas Vaars. <https://www.searchgurbani.com/bhai-gurdas-vaaran/vaar/1/pauri/27/line/1>
10. LAL, H. A. A., ROSHAN (2019) Guru Nanak's religious Pluralism and Sri Guru Granth Sahib (New Delhi, Guru Nanak Foundation).
11. BOWKER, J. (2000) The Concise Oxford Dictionary of World Religions (UK, Oxford University Press). <http://www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/acref/9780192800947.001.0001/acref-9780192800947-miscMatter-3>
12. NOOR, H. S. (2004) Connecting the Dots in Sikh History (Chandigarh, Institute of Sikh Studies).
13. DAWE, D. G. (1997) Nanak, Guru (Sri Guru Nanak Dev), in: Singh, H. (Ed.) The Encyclopaedia of Sikhism (Patiala, Punjabi University).
14. SINGH, J. (???) Bhai Gurdas Vaaran http://searchgurbani.com/bhai_gurdas_vaaran/vaar/3/pauri/15.
15. SGPC Guru Nanak Sahib <http://sgpc.net/gurus/gurunanak.asp>.
16. SINGH, U. (1954 (1995)) Sacha Guru (Punjabi) (Amritsar, Singh Brothers).
17. THIND, K. S. Sri Granth. <http://www.srigranth.org/servlet/gurbani.gurbani?S=y>
18. CHAHAL, D. S. (2008) Nanakian Philosophy Basics for Humanity (Laval, QC, Canada, Institute for Understanding Sikhism).
19. CUNNINGHAM, J. D. ((1849) 1981) A History of the Punjab (New Delhi, S. Chand & Company Ltd.).
20. SINGH, K. (1997 (Reprint)) Katik kae Vaisakh (Punjabi (Ludhiana, Lahore Bookshop).
21. CHAHAL, D. S. (2000) Commencing Verse of the Aad Guru Granth Sahib, Understanding Sikhism Res. J., 2 (1), p 8. <http://iuscanada.com/journal/archives/2000/j0201p08.pdf>.
22. CHAHAL, D. S. (2002) A Unique Concept of God in Nanakian Philosophy, Understanding Sikhism Res. J., 4 (2), p 5.
23. CHAHAL, D. S. (2003) JAP: The Essence of Nanakian Philosophy (Laval, Quebec, Canada Institute for Understanding Sikhism, Distributors: Singh Brothers, Amritsar).
24. CHAHAL, D. S. (2005) Oankaar or Omkaar: The Misunderstood Word - Annotation by Guru Nanak, Understanding Sikhism Res. J., 7 (2), p 17.
25. CHAHAL, D. S. (2018 (Revised Version)) JAP: The Essence of Nanakian Philosophy (a scientific and Logical Interpretation) <http://iuscanada.com/books/2018/JAP-2018-%20Final-filtered.html>
26. CHAHAL, D. S. (2018) Cosmology according to Guru Nanak I, The Sikh Review 65 (12), p 16.
27. CHAHAL, D. S. (2019) Cosmology According to Guru Nanak II, The Sikh Review, 66 (2), p 10.
28. SINGH, K. (1981) Mahan Kosh (Patiala, India, Bhasha Vibag Punjab).
29. CHAHAL, D. S. (2015) Sabd (ਸਬਦ): The Guru of Nanak, Understanding Sikhism Res. J. , 17 (1), p 37. <http://www.iuscanada.com/journal/archives/2015/j1701p37.pdf>.